



City Research Online

City, University of London Institutional Repository

Citation: Scamell, M., Macfarlane, A. J., McCourt, C., Rayment, J., Sunderland, J. & Stewart, M. (2013). NICE on Caesarean Section: NICE says caesarean section is not available on demand unless clinically indicated. *British Medical Journal (BMJ)*, 347(f4649), doi: 10.1136/bmj.f4649

This is the accepted version of the paper.

This version of the publication may differ from the final published version.

Permanent repository link: <http://openaccess.city.ac.uk/12745/>

Link to published version: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.f4649>

Copyright and reuse: City Research Online aims to make research outputs of City, University of London available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the author(s) and/or copyright holders. URLs from City Research Online may be freely distributed and linked to.

City Research Online:

<http://openaccess.city.ac.uk/>

publications@city.ac.uk

Re: NICE promises on infertility and caesarean section are unmet

4 July 2013

We read with some alarm the letter published in the BMJ by Lawrence Mascarenhas, Zachary Nash and Bassem entitled, "NICE promises on infertility and caesarean section are unmet". We concur with the authors that current underfunding in the NHS is having grave consequences upon our national maternal health service provision and deserves careful scrutiny and critical comment. Moreover, we recognise that these authors are excellently placed to offer such scrutiny and comment. What is unhelpful is the misleading medico/legal description of elective caesarean section. These authors claim that current NICE guidelines 'state that all pregnant women should be able to choose an elective caesarean without obstetric or psychological indications.'

This is somewhat at variance with both the guideline and current legal/ethical precedent. NICE (1) suggest that where requests for caesareans are based on anxiety, mothers should be offered referral to a perinatal mental health professional. The recommendation is that a caesarean section should only be offered if this fails. The authors' reading of the 2011 NICE guideline by contrast, suggests that caesarean section is available on demand. We would like to take this opportunity to point out that this reading not only fails to pass the Bolam test but contravenes existing medico/legal precedent set in 2004 through the R (Leslie Burke) v General Medical Council (2) - where it was held that there is no right to treatment on demand (paras 30 - 31).

We would like to stress therefore that current legal precedent and clinical guidelines hold that surgical interventions, such as caesarean section, are NOT available on demand unless clinically indicated.

1. CG132 Caesarean section: NICE guideline. 08 February 2013. Accessed July 3 2013. <http://guidance.nice.org.uk/CG132/NICEGuidance/pdf/English>
2. R (Leslie Burke) v General Medical Council [2004] EWHC 1879 (Admin) Accessed July 3 2013 from: <http://www.hailshamchambers.com/downloads/rburke.pdf>

Competing interests: None declared

Mandie Scamell PhD, RM- Lecturer in Midwifery, Early Years Division, City University London, 30 Bartholmew Close, London EC1A 7PN, UK

Alison Macfarlane BA, Dip Stat, C Stat, FFPH - Professor in Women's and Child health, Early Years Division, City University London, 30 Bartholmew Close, London EC1A 7PN, UK

Christine McCourt PhD, MA - Professor in Women's and Child health, Early Years Division, City University London, 30 Bartholmew Close, London EC1A 7PN, UK

Juliet Rayment PhD, MA - Research Fellow, Early Years Division, City University London, 30 Bartholmew Close, London EC1A 7PN, UK

Judith Sunderland MSc, RM - Lecturer and Programme Lead in Midwifery, Early Years Division, City University London, 30 Bartholmew Close, London EC1A 7PN, UK

Mary Stewart PhD, RM - Research Midwife, Life Study, University College London, London WC1N 1EH, UK