City Research Online

City, University of London Institutional Repository

Guest Editorial: Challenging the Coloniality of Raced Markets

Haseeb Shabbir (Corresponding Author)
Reader in Marketing
Department of Logistics, Marketing, Hospitality and Analytics
Huddersfield Business School, University of Huddersfield
Queensgate, Huddersfield, HD1 3DH, United Kingdom
Voice Phone: 01484 257979, Email: H.A.Shabbir@hud.ac.uk

Michael R. Hyman
Founder and President, Institute for Marketing Futurology and Philosophy
5260 Redman Road, Las Cruces, NM 88011-7556
Voice Phone: 575-522-8463, Email: mhyman@nmsu.edu
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6675-8808
ResearcherID: E-3442-2018
Scopus Author ID: 7005893805

Alena Kostyk
Senior Lecturer in Marketing
Adam Smith Business School, University of Glasgow
Glasgow, G12 8QQ, United Kingdom
Voice Phone: +44 (0)7377 411523, Email: Alena.Kostyk@glasgow.ac.uk

Author Biographies

Dr. Haseeb Shabbir is a Reader in Marketing at Huddersfield Business School, University of Huddersfield. Passionate about marketing ethics, peace marketing, and fundraising, his work has also appeared in leading marketing journals such as the *Journal of Service Research, Journal of Advertising, Journal of Advertising Research, Psychology & Marketing, European Journal of Marketing, Industrial Marketing Management,* and *Journal of Business Ethics*. Haseeb's research interests span ethics in advertising and not profit marketing.

Dr. Michael R. Hyman is President and Founder of the Institute for Marketing Futurology and Philosophy. He is also a Distinguished Achievement Professor of Marketing at New Mexico State University. His roughly 125 academic journal articles, 60 conference papers, four co-authored/co-edited books, 30 other academic contributions, and 50 non-academic works, attest to his writing compulsion. He has served on 16 editorial review boards and as a journal co-editor and associate editor. His research interests include marketing theory, marketing ethics, consumer advertising, survey research methods, philosophical analyses in marketing, and marketing

futurology. Now a loyal New Mexican, he splits his time between Las Cruces and Cloudcroft with his wife, four sons, three dogs, and three cats.

Dr. Alena Kostyk is a Senior Lecturer in Marketing at the University of Glasgow in Glasgow, UK. Her work has appeared in academic outlets such as the *Journal of Business Research*, *European Journal of Marketing, Journal of Consumer Behaviour, International Journal of Market Research,* and *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing*. Before entering academia, Dr. Kostyk spent nearly ten years working in the private sector. Her research interests include innovative research methodology and human decision-making in futuristic environments and marketplaces.

Racism still governs the entire global political and economic system…as long as we delude ourselves with re-branding and tinkering at the margins, we will never be able to address the issue of racism.

---Kehinde Andrews, 2021

The tragic death of George Floyd and the Black Lives Matter (BLM) movement spotlighted the systemic discriminatory practices that characterize the experiences of Black and other minority communities. Such practices have evolved since the Trans-Atlantic slave trade era. The subtle and liquid manifestations of these discriminatory practices and associated micro-aggressions can be difficult for organizations and societies to identify and correct, which augments their insidious nature (Shabbir *et al.*, 2014; Yan and Hyman, 2021).

Business scholars have scrutinized these problematic practices; for example, promoting stereotypes via tone-deaf marketing communications or engaging in opportunistic and inauthentic brand activism (Crockett, 2022; Leak et al., 2021; Mirzaei et al., 2022; Vredenburg et al., 2020). Racial group representations in contemporary marketing communications remain a concern (e.g., Davis, 2018; Potts, 1997). Although some companies have responded to public pressure by replacing established brand spokescharacters (e.g., Aunt Jemima and Uncle Ben's), contemporary advertisers have often transmogrified but not eliminated established stereotypes (Bristor *et al*., 1995; Shabbir *et al*., 2014).

Marketing scholars troubled by the under-researching of specific consumer communities have conducted studies about White privilege and White ideology (e.g., Burton, 2009a,b; Davis, 2018; Johnson *et al*., 2019; Tadajewski, 2012) and have proposed teaching practices sensitive to minority group experiences (Eckhardt *et al.,* 2022; Grier, 2020). To further such interests, the five articles in this special issue explore how marketing thought and practice have contributed to

systemic racism but could alleviate racially insensitive and biased practices. Before introducing those articles, we begin with a historical overview.

Historical Overview

As a form of cultural agency, marketing has consolidated racist ideology, particularly in promoting Whiteness. *Raced market* refers to race's intrinsic role in contemporary markets (Tilley and Shilliam, 2017). *Commodity racism* assumes racism reinforces the structural inequalities inherent to consumption (Hund *et al*., 2013; McClintock, 2020). Race is neither a rare intrusion nor epiphenomenal (Tilley and Shilliam, 2017). Instead, it deeply intertwines with marketing practice (Thomas *et al.*, 2020). Racial subjugation has epitomized capitalism, colonialism, modernism, liberalism, and neo-liberalism (Cherniavsky, 2006).

Although neo-liberals often consider race an extraneous corollary, capitalism and race intertwine (Beckles, 2013; Patterson, 1991). Federici (2004, p.7) elaborates, "Capitalism, as a social-economic system, is necessarily committed to racism and sexism. For capitalism must justify and mystify the contradictions built into its social relations.…If capitalism has been able to reproduce itself it is only because of the web of inequalities that it has built into the body of the world proletariat." As evinced by the transfer of wealth from our world's southern to northern hemisphere, neo-liberal globalization sustains these inequalities. In 1983, the World Trade Organization enacted an inequity-accelerating trade system. By 2017, the northern hemisphere extracted $2.2 trillion annually from the southern hemisphere, fifteen times the cost of eliminating extreme poverty worldwide (Hickel *et al*., 2021).

If colonialism's logic was to "integrate the Global South into the Europe-centred world economy on unequal terms…it…remains true today" (Hickel *et al.*, 2021, p.1). Colonialism's marketing rests on the tenant, "colonizers are superior to the colonized, and…are altruistically

bringing civilization" (Jackson Sow, 2009, p.162). For example, the notion of 'maternal Africa'

as barren, spoiled, and needing saving was instrumental to the West's scramble for Africa

(Comaroff, 1993). To justify wholesale genocides, colonizers morally disengaged from such

horrors by convincing themselves the colonized were "barbaric, static and void of history or

culture" (Jackson Sow, 2009, p.165). This dehumanization of 'other people' relied on marketing

northerners' racial superiority.

By aligning temptation with imperial violence, commodity racism fused colonial progress

with mass-produced 'consumer spectacles' (Hund *et al*., 2013; McClintock, 1995). Commodity

racism functioned as a "surrogate [with] whiteness as a promise of belonging" (Hund *et al*.,

2013, p.15), thus buttressing the working class against social discontent. It brought these 'left

behind' masses or *residuum* into the wider civilizing mission of elite-driven social polity (Tilley

and Shilliam, 2017). Thus, commodity racism prevailed and melded with the political economy's

goal to provide symbolic racial capital for everyone.

In 18th and 19th century Europe, racism became increasingly codified, gaining socio-

intellectual authority and "increasingly coming to order centralizing state order and function,

institutionalization and practice" (Goldberg, 2009, p.3). Leaders advancing hegemonic agendas

adapted Spanish-style colonial conquests and their prototypical benchmark of White national

purity. Such racism protected White supremacy and its associated privileges via modernism and

'progress' (Bonila-Silva, 2001). By the late 19th century, race had assumed an ideographic social

function—a taken-for-granted or commonsense logic (Goldberg, 2009). Racism's

commodification was vital to mainstreaming its logic, especially among the lower classes.

The utopian promise of capitalism and neo-liberalism is 'faith that things will improve'

(i.e., progressive hope). Key to this mythology is perpetuating a revitalized Social Darwinism

with corporate-stylized "self-interest becom[ing] the organizing principle for a winner-take-all society" (Giroux, 2003, p.195). A live-and-let-die cultural pedagogy pervaded this 'markets determine racial justice' paradigm (Banerjee, 2006; Giroux, 2003). The promise and pursuit of unprecedented freedoms aligned with avoiding unprecedented insecurities, and "when there is insecurity, little time is left for caring for values that hover above the level of daily concern" (Bauman, 2001, p.159).

Limpieza de Sangre (Purity of Blood) and Eugenics

Although slavery and racism have existed since antiquity, their progression into a polysemic structure linking persons to state polity was formalized and codified in the West. One incubating ideology was *limpieza de sangre* (purity of blood), which arose to justify the Spanish Inquisition (i.e., identifying heretics among converts from Judaism and subsequently Islam to Catholicism). The discursive form of this ideology became *raza* (i.e., originally for describing equine pedigree purity but transmogrified for describing human racial purity), which became a socializing rhetoric for instrumentalizing race as a national identity marker (Eliav-Feldon *et al*., 2009). No longer a physical-only vehicle, blood now entailed "cultural traits: moral, characterological, spiritual, [and] moral" (Martinez *et al*., 2012, p.1). To rationalize genocide, colonial competitors developed customized variants of race-based superiority complexes.

By 1900, the White pure-blood fallacy of *limpieza de sangre* and its variants were normalized, but with a renewed and scientific vindication via Social Darwinism and, eventually, the eugenics movement (Crotty *et al*., 2000). Eugenics provided a more pathologically evolved polysemous structure, linking people to the national and collective polity or a "fusion between the biological finitude of the individual and the eternal existence of the nation" (Turda, 2012, p.19). A heinous vindication of beliefs about improving global humanity's service to the White

'master race', it spread vehemently throughout the West's conscience, culminating in Nazi Germany's concentration camps. As its founder Francis Galton aspired, eugenics became a 'national conscience, like a new religion' (Rosen, 2004).

Eugenics was steeped in "social and cultural renewal….as the emblematic expression of programmatic modernism" (Turda, 2012, p.2). It "was a continuing presence in the public sphere" (Currell and Cogdell, 2006, p.3), especially as a panacea to the working classes' social discontent during the Great Depression. Eugenics' biopolitical epistemology "emerged as one of the most convincing answers to a series of social, economic and political crises characterizing European modernity since the late nineteenth century" (Turda, 2012, p.18).

Eugenics seemingly provided a scientific solution to the residuum problem, with the elite establishment entrusted to solve social problems via evolved Whiteness phantasmagorias (Tilley and Shilliam, 2017). This era's obsession with idealized body images emerged from promoting the eugenic ideal—appeals that "remain central to Western culture" (Currell and Cogdell, 2006, p.9). During the 1920s and 1930s, appeals focused on speed, efficiency, and health; beauty, performance, and innate quality were consolidated as product value (Cogdell, 2010). Values "mirrored the eugenic complex" of ideal traits, with consumers aspiring to become "classy, health conscious, [and] educated" (Cogdell, 2010, p.178), re-assuring middle-class White families they could symbolically distance themselves from minority groups. The marketing of the ideal teenage girl as "Dainty, pure, charming, lively, pretty, gay, chaste, hygienic, [and] smart," but White (Clifford, 2021, p.2), was mainstreamed as eugenic idealism (Shah, 2015).

Pursuing eugenics' mission to create a healthy population via social and national purification provided a convenient corollary to Europe's brief inter-World War period. Recasting and mainstreaming an empire's eugenics-based civilizing ideology as a health issue was essential

to forging favorable public attitudes (Bashford, 2012). Underpinning eugenics ideology was Neo-Darwinian transhumanism (Huxley, 1957), an 'omega version' of ourselves (Fuller and Lipinska, 2014), and Nietzsche's *Übermensch* (i.e., super-man) (Bashford and Levine, 2011). Post-1930 National Socialism was heavily influenced by its secular forerunner, Haeckel's *monism*, the Spinozian proposition that "mind and matter, or thought and extension, were but two modes of a single substance" (Weir, 2012, p.2). As a National Socialism precursor (Gasman, 1971), Haeckel's *monism* justified Nazi Germany's eugenics programs by positing that cultural capital contributed to some lives' value. Sadly, because it failed to end racism, the culmination and defeat of eugenics in Nazi Germany provided an alternative grand narrative for a new White identity project contrary to notions about 'an eviler race' or Nazi racism as an "aberration in European history, a discontinuity" (Erichsen and Olusoga, 2010, p.3).

Modernism

Modernism and its underlying transhumanist weltanschauung served as incubators to "restore a sense of higher purpose, transcendence, and *Zauber* to a spiritually starved modern humanity condemned by 'progress'" (Turda, 2012, p.7). When the cultural category 'European' replaced the racial category 'White', culture rather than color gained priority in shaping the West's post-WWII identity (Blaut, 1992). This supplanting subsequently became modernism's foundational narrative because it delineated the world into 'developing' versus 'developed' or 'traditional and thus static' versus 'modern and thus dynamic', with 'modern' typifying the West and eventually neo-colonialism's basis (Banerjee and Linstead, 2001; Jackson Sow, 2003; White, 2003).

The key implication of modernism: although everyone is equal and has the same opportunity to become modern and dynamic, the West, given its credibility as the world's foremost modern culture, was and still is best suited to help other nations and cultures to

modernize. Modernism assumed the southern hemisphere's people were inferior, albeit more subtly, thus retaining the "white man's burden in developing an underdeveloped world" (Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013, p.74). Hence, "[w]hat was needed…was Western 'intervention' to help traditional societies make the change to modernity" (Kumar, 2012, p.38), spawning belief in a third world with two billion people becoming "transmogrified into an inverted mirror of others' reality: a mirror that belittles them and sends them off to the end of the queue" (Esteva, 1992, p.7).

Proctor and Gamble's Ivory soap advertising was a long-lived case study in conditioning purity with White women. Similarly, Uniliver's recently discontinued Fair and Lovely brand in India shows eugenics' and neo-liberalism's persistent hold on post-colonial audiences. Pairing White women with purity pervades the marketing spectrum. Its corollary, the 'global White mother' or "white women's bodies…spilling into the global community and offering visions and hopes of a multicultural global family" (Shome, 2011, p.389), remains endemic in humanitarian communications. Linking the 'poor African child needing rescue' imagery to the global White mother narrative provides a context for positioning 'White benevolent love' against failed non-White indigenous motherhood (Comaroff, 1993).

Perhaps modernism's most enduring naturalization of racism comes from Fair Trade imagery. Celebrated as the West's consumption conscience, this imagery hints at the tea and cocoa ads of the 1920s (Chouliarki, 2011; Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013). Colonial tea ads represented Indian women as content and productive, almost grateful for the British Empire's uneven wealth extraction, with White consumers appreciating these women's hard work and enterprising spirit. In cocoa ads, the happy-go-lucky imagery of Africans was a constant theme, depicting "Africa as the abode of simple folk with simple pleasures, naturalizing and racializing

its position within unequal structures of production and trade" (Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013, p.86). Consumers still absorb this imagery as normal because it feeds into neo-liberalism's worldview or 'dream world', i.e., the collective mental state of "modernity as re-enchantment of the world" and associated "expressions of a utopian desire for social arrangements that transcend existing forms" (Buck-Morss, 2002, pp.x-xi).

Neo-liberalism and Liquid Racism

The post-WWII anti-colonial and civil rights movements made neo-liberalism central to the West's reputation for upholding human rights and freedom (Melamed, 2006). Depictions consistent with racial liberalism replaced pre-WWI's overt racist imagery and pre-WWII's overt eugenics appeals. Ad images became more inclusive and racially diverse, and companies increasingly recognized the economic viability of appeals to non-White markets. Rising political and civil rights activism offered new grounds to condition freedom by co-opting increasingly popular racial and gender rights while paradoxically ignoring continued racial and gender violence (Hong, 2015; Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013).

Neo-liberalism fostered the notion that personal choice explains human agency, including an ability to resolve social issues. By atomizing personal and private freedom, it restrained freedom's potential as distributive and relational (Shabbir *et al*., 2020). With public spaces' privatization, "freedom is no longer linked to a collective effort…[but an] "exercise in self-development rather than social responsibility" (Giroux, 2003, p.197). Hence, neo-liberalism's answer to racial inequality was eliminating personal-prejudice-induced racial bias by making all structural, cultural, and sociological parameters 'color blind' (i.e., race-neutral). However, color blindness falsely sustains the myth of racism's demise and denies ongoing systemic racism

(Kendi, 2023). As Giroux (2003, p.193) noted, "Marketplace ideologies…reduce all racial problems to private issues such as individual character."

A complex assemblage reveals neo-liberalism's resolution of racism while sustaining deeply rooted inequalities. This multi-layered 'racism within racism' or *liquid racism* (Weaver, 2011) derives from Bauman's (2000) *liquid modernity* or ambivalence's increasing privatization as a social norm. As Weaver (2011, p.252) explains, the fluidity of liquid racism makes it "difficult to collect or identify because it may escape or dissolve before it can be contained, and is explicitly encouraged or given coverage in mass media."

Although it reflects the recent and heightened wave of corporate anti-racism efforts, neo-liberalism's globalization in the 1980s yielded a twist: multi-culturalism's promulgation by neo-liberalists. *Woke capitalism*, a neo-liberalism variant, presumes multi-culturalism, equality, and socially transformative consumption (van Tine, 2021). For example, Benneton's campaign for multi-cultural harmony assures consumers they can solve political and social problems by purchasing the 'right' clothing and fashion goods (Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013). By promoting such consumption, Benneton became evidence for "consumer culture as a force that can create progressive change" (Ramamurthy and Wilson, 2013, p.78). Ironically, woke capitalism conceals profiteering from the southern hemisphere's cheaper labor (i.e., ignores racial suffering induced by global capitalism's unequal value chains and resource distributions).

The Black Lives Matter movement discredited neo-liberalism and challenged its relegating racism to historical and personal choices. To confront this challenge, neo-liberalists re-infused racial discourse with marketing logic, shifting the historicity of Black suffering to commodity activism. Under neo-liberalism, corporations dominate the anti-racism kudos. Celebrating corporate-led Black tokenism normalized and mainstreamed the neo-liberals'

progressive hope. Rather than opposing structural inequalities inherent to neo-liberalism, social causes reconfigured themselves without making neo-liberalism nonsensical (Kanai and Gill, 2000; Mukherjee and Banet-Weiser, 2012). The effortless immediacy afforded by social media, specifically slacktivism, has technologized action but reduced moral imagination to instant gratification (cf. Chouliaraki, 2010).

Neo-liberalism discourages translating "private sufferings into public issues" (Bauman, 2001, p.205) and encourages identity politics. It only supports anti-racism interventions that create economic utility. It applauds corporate reports highlighting enhanced profits induced by embracing greater diversity. It co-opts Black gatekeepers to prove the market's 'can-do attitude', relegating anti-racism efforts to self-development and personal emancipation. It amplifies special cases of private and corporate racism, using them to celebrate racism's end—a fractured and delusional myth—mistakenly rather than ensuring a meaningful discourse about global racial inequalities.

Article Introductions

Our special issue opens with June Francis' epic account, entitled "Rescuing marketing from its colonial roots." Francis' review scrutinizes contemporary marketing's raced etiology. The Trans-Atlantic slave trade, and its associated slave plantations, were "one of the most ambitious experiments in social engineering of the early modern era" (Oster-Hammel and Petersson, 2005, p.47). This market witnessed the historically largest wholesale commodification of enslaved people as products to be priced, advertised, and distributed. Some of our best-known household brand names, from Cadburys to Unilever, have roots in the Trans-Atlantic slave trade. The era's advertisers were 'imperial persuaders', selling colonialism to domestic and international audiences (Ramamurthy, 2017). The ontological security of promoting Whiteness kept the

working classes in a vortex of self-mystification, an illusionary bubble reinforced and reaffirmed by exotic commodities. Francis illustrates commodity racism with several case studies. Her choice of colonial soap advertising is especially pertinent because it shows how commodity racism and aesthetics relate reciprocally and why commodity racism is ultimately rooted in its underlying political economy.

Pears soap's infamous 'White girl washing the Ethiopian child' image popularized commodity racism, making it available "to a broad cross-class spectrum of actual and potential consumers" (Hund *et al*., 2013, p.9). The embedded value was the imperial duty to civilize Black 'savages'. In these ads, Pears soap transforms from a cleanser to a vindication and celebration of Whiteness and its civilizing mission, an invitation for the White masses to imagine and enjoy racial superiority through violent Whiteness phantasmagorias (Hund *et al*., 2013). Pears launched this ad during a Pan-European Berlin conference in December 1884 that called for legitimizing imperialism in West Africa. Thus, the Pears ad is poignant because it suggests (anti-)racism and marketing can not be decoupled from prevailing market ideologies.

"Representation of women of color on the covers of the top three fashion magazines: A content analysis," by Natalie Mitchell, Tony Stovall, and David Avalos, reaffirms the pernicious and historical tradition of the fashion sector as a socio-cultural venue for perpetuating White racial mythology. A content analysis of Vogue, Cosmopolitan, and Vanity Fair front covers from 2006 to 2018 shows White women appeared on 86% of covers. In contrast, Black women appeared on 9% of covers, Latinas on 4%, and Asians on 0.2%. Mitchell *et al*. also report that when Blacks and Latinos are represented, they tend to be sexualized more than Whites. These findings support the fashion sector as an ongoing venue for perpetuating 'pure White

womanhood' (Shome, 2011) in classic racialized and eugenics tropes of the "sensible over the sexual…[the] efficient, upright and honest…[over the] colorful and fun" (Chapkis, 1988, p.131).

This racial-beauty tradition is steeped in colonial practices because "the blind faith of the white woman gives moral purpose to her [White] madman's deeds" (Chapkis, 1988, p.49). The Black Ape myth, and its gender variants, reinforced the idea that 'predatory and seductive' Black women were dangerous. This Jezebel stereotype grew from colonial times and was instrumental in legislating forced sterilization laws predominantly targeting Black women in the U.S. (Anderson *et al*., 2018; Dikotter, 1998; Randall, 1996). Sadly, this Black trope continues. Mitchell *et al*. reinforce reports that women of color, especially Black women, have been hypersexualized by the fashion, music, and entertainment industries (e.g., Stephens and Philips, 2003; Turner, 2011) and mainstream advertising (Shabbir *et al*., 2014). They suggest that future studies on racial imagery in ads should map such trope's prevalence in marketing practice.

The article by Anne-Maree O'Rourke, Alex Belli, and Frank Mathmann, entitled "Mitigating implicit racial bias in tipping: When direct and indirect experience matters," focuses on the effect of racial stereotyping on workers in gig-based service economies. Because "racialised logics are embedded within gig economy work relations," this increasingly evident normalization has limited and slowed ameliorating changes (Orr *et al*., 2023, p.204). Conceptualizing tipping behaviors as implicitly biased compensatory mechanisms toward minority service staff, they found (1) longer unrated service encounters induce larger tips, (2) shorter rated service encounters induce more equitable tips, and (3) tips and ratings for minority service staff correlate positively. The practical implications for minority service staff include encouraging positive ratings, especially for shorter encounters, and allocating longer but non-well-being-threatening encounters.

O'Rourke *et al*. encourage overhauling tipping practices due to their tainted history. Pooling tips and allocating a fixed percentage for workers are two simple and logical systemic changes they suggest. Regarding future research, they recommend exploring service tipping psychology and its implications, especially the effect of balancing longer encounters with service staff well-being. They also establish the need for more discourse about anti-racism and marketing within the new platform economies.

In "Linguistic racism in inter-culture service encounter," Aaminah Zaman Malik and Audhesh Paswan investigate how non-native customers experience linguistic racism effects in inter-cultural service encounters (ICSE). They present a dynamic model to illustrate the experiences of non-native service experiences. Pre-encounter, non-native customers have referent stigmatization perceptions caused by socio-political factors or previous experiences. These perceptions can affect decisions about engaging in ICSE. Once in ICSE, non-native customers may be predisposed to heightened anxiety and a concomitant lack of inclusivity caused by stereotyping threats from service employees, other customers, or the servicescape. Non-native customers' negative experiences may trigger avoidance behaviors such as seeking alternatives—especially technology-based alternatives such as drive-throughs or online ordering. Malik and Paswan extend linguicism knowledge within a micro-meso ICSE context and conclude with interesting recommendations about A.I. language personalization and users' preferences.

Although linguistic racism or linguicism, which entails confirming, normalizing, or reformulating unequal linguistic power among users, is under-researched, it intersects traditional racism (Dovchin, 2020; Skutnabb-Kangas, 2015). Ethnic accent bullying is a frequent racist behavior encountered by minority group members. Linguistic racism and the more virulent

linguicide pervade colonial ideology. Under its civilization mission, French colonialism has a rich history of humanizing the French language as 'incorruptible' while debasing other languages and their related cultures as illogical and inadequate (Calvert, 1987, p.71). For Brits, English language mastery was the "most important agent for the coloured population of the colonies" (quoted in Ashby 1966, p.150). In a post-colonial world, covert linguicism continues to colonialize minds (Skutnabb-Kangas, 2015). However, scholarship about its marketing and communications ramifications remains limited.

In "The 40 years of discourse on racism in the Brazilian advertising self-regulation system," Lais Rodrigues, Marcus Hemais, and Alessandra Costa reveal the effect of linguicism on advertising self-regulation in Brazil. They show how and why the International Chamber of Commerce's 1937 Code, the predominant source for most self-regulation codes of advertising conduct, is ill-equipped to address the full spectrum of racist issues in advertising and communications. Rodrigues *et al*. found Conar, Brazil's self-regulatory advertising body, dismissed 69% of the 68 racial content cases brought to it. Most cases were dismissed regardless of category (i.e., color line, socio-economics, or locus of origin-based stereotyping). Whether containing blatant or subtle racial imagery (Shabbir *et al*., 2014), Conar tended to judge such ads as non-discriminatory.

Rodrigues *et al*. reveal the urgent need for mapping racial imagery in global markets. They also denote the weaknesses of challenging raced markets. Although re-branding and fringe changes provide a neo-liberal solution to anti-racist marketing, sustainable change demands more robust and updated regulatory interventions to screen out overt, subtle, and liquid forms of racial content (Andrews, 2022). Existing frameworks insufficiently address these regulatory needs.

Complimenting these changes, advertising agencies in general and 'advertising creatives' in particular must learn to identify and eliminate racial content (Yan and Hyman, 2021).

Conclusion

We concur with the three recommendations in Giroux (2003). First, attempts at anti-racism must tackle the intersection between neo-liberalism and racial injustice. Second, the 'raceless state' myth should be re-addressed. Third, the role of cultural pedagogy (i.e., cultural, social, and public discourse; agencies such as marketing and media) in normalizing racism should be investigated. Hence, we argue that marketing-centric anti-racism efforts must recognize neo-liberalism's pervasive role in normalizing raced markets and reject conventional wisdom about a raceless cultural pedagogy. The challenges remain substantial, especially with the emergence of platform economies.

As marketers increasingly embrace big data and A.I., concerns remain that data colonialism is historical colonialism revisited. The "global flows of data are as expansive as historic colonialism's appropriation of land, resources, and bodies, although the epicenter has somewhat shifted" (Couldry and Mejias, 2019, p.2). The evolution of a 'data dream world' is positioned as techno-enlightenment, with "society as the natural beneficiary of corporations' extractive efforts, just as humanity was supposed to benefit from historical colonialism as a 'civilizational' project" (Couldry and Mejias, 2019, p.2). A savvy data-driven algorithmic coloniality (e.g., of Africa) or modern-day scramble is underway (Birhane, 2020; Coleman, 2018; Mohamed *et al*., 2020). Because data colonialism uses "more insidious means to enrich the wealthy and powerful at the great expense of the poor" (Hao, 2022), the algorithmic invasion of domestic and indigenous global communities represents a pernicious echoing of colonial-era exploitation (Birhane, 2020). For example, the raced markets spectacle now ensures the global

'ghost worker' underclass remains 'intentionally hidden' and escalating fears about A.I. replacing human labor mystified by neo-liberal coloniality's 'progress rhetoric' (Gray and Suri, 2019).

Many marketing scholars are calling for neo-liberalism's further critique and a better understanding of their discipline's role in perpetuating violence (Eckhardt *et al*., 2013; Varman, 2018). Interest in the race-marketing intersection is gaining traction (e.g., Gabriel, 1994; Johnson *et al*., 2021; Thomas *et al*., 2020). The challenge for mainstream marketing theory and practice is acknowledging that raced markets exist. Scrutinizing these markets demands exploring mutations of colonial racial practices and representations. Disentangling liquid racism in marketing is vital to learning how neo-liberalism accommodates and appropriates racial justice with token brand gestures and within new platform economies. Algorithmic coloniality and its implications for data necro-polity demand further study. However, normalizing algorithmic coloniality by re-melding 'new eugenics' and transhumanism complicates liquid racism's disentanglement.

For marketing to stop perpetuating raced markets, educators should mainstream anti-racism and marketing. Race is not an epiphenomenon of marketing practice (Tilley and Shilliam, 2018), nor should it be to marketing pedagogy or scholarship (Johnson *et al.*, 2019). The Race in the Marketplace research network provides a repository and core resource for marketing students and curriculum developers. Many current marketing practices are rooted in Black slavery's instrumentalization and emancipation, providing a backdrop for introducing anti-racism to marketing students. Commodity racism provides a historical and contemporary window into the critical and responsible marketing skills universities help students develop. Teaching aspiring marketers about it is crucial to decoupling future markets from racial dynamics. Hence,

marketing pedagogues should revisit and develop Eckhardt *et al.*'s (2022) and Francis's (2022) call for decolonizing marketing and its education.

References

Anderson, J.R., Holland, E., Heldreth, C., and Johnson, S.P. (2018), "Revisiting the Jezebel stereotype: The impact of target race on sexual objectification", *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, Vol. 42 No. 4, pp. 461-476.

Andrews, K. (2021), *The new age of empire: How racism and colonialism still rule the world,* Bold Type Books, New York, NY.

Ashby, E. (1966), *Universities: British, Indian, African. A study in the ecology of higher education*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA.

Banerjee, S.B. (2006), "Live and let die: Colonial sovereignties and the death worlds of necrocapitalism", *Borderlands*, Vol.5 No.1, http://www.borderlands.net.au/vol5no1_2006/banerjee_live.htm.

Banerjee, S.B. and Linstead, S. (2001), "Globalization, multiculturalism and other fictions: Colonialism for the new millennium?", *Organization*, Vol. 8 No. 4, pp. 683-722.

Bashford, A. (2003). *Imperial hygiene: A critical history of colonialism, nationalism and public health*, Palgrave Macmillan, New York, NY.

Bashford, A. and Levine, P. (Eds.) (2010), *The Oxford handbook of the history of eugenics*, Oxford University Press, New York, NY.

Bauman, Z. (2001), *The individualized society*, Polity Press, Malden, MA.

Bauman, Z. (2000), *Liquid modernity*, Polity, Cambridge, U.K.

Beckles, H. (2013), *Britain's Black debt: Reparations for Caribbean slavery and native genocide (Vol. 195)*, University of West Indies Press, Kingston, Jamaica.

Birhane, A. (2020), "Algorithmic colonization of Africa", *SCRIPTed*, Vol. 17 No. 2, pp. 389-409.

Blaut, J. M. (1992), "The theory of cultural racism", *Antipode*, Vol. 24 No. 4, pp. 289-299.

Bonilla-Silva, E. (2001), *White supremacy and racism in the post-civil rights era*, Lynne Rienner Publishers, Boulder, CO.

Bristor, J. M., Lee, G. R., and Hunt, M. R. (1995), "Race and ideology: African-American images in television advertising", *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, Vol. 14 No. 1, pp. 48-59.

Buck-Morss, S. (2002), *Dreamworld and catastrophe: The passing of mass utopia in East and West*, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA.

Burton, D. (2009a), ""Reading' whiteness in consumer research", *Consumption, Markets and Culture*, Vol. 12 No. 2, pp. 171-201.

Burton, D. (2009b), "Non-white readings of whiteness", *Consumption, Markets and Culture*, Vol. 12 No. 4, pp. 349-372.

Calvert, P. (1987), "The theory of political succession, in Calvert, P. (Ed.), *The Process of Political Succession*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, U.K., pp. 245-266.

Chapkis, W. (1988), *Beauty secrets: Women and the politics of appearance,* Women's Press, London, U.K.

Cherniavsky, E. (2006), *Incorporations: Race, nation, and the body politics of capital*, University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, MN.

Chouliaraki, L. (2010), "Post-humanitarianism: Humanitarian communication beyond a politics of pity", *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, Vol. 13 No. 2, pp. 107-126.

Clifford, K. and Turner, P.R. (2021), *Consumerism, eugenics, and the 'ideal teenage girl' in 1910-1940 American culture,* Minds@UW Eau Claire, http://digital.library.wisc.edu/1793/82622.

Cogdell, C. (2010), *Eugenic design: Streamlining America in the 1930s,* University of

    Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, PA.

Coleman, D. (2018), "Digital colonialism: The 21st century scramble for Africa through the

    extraction and control of user data and the limitations of data protection laws", *Michigan*

    Journal of Race & Law, Vol. 24 No. 2,

    https://repository.law.umich.edu/mjrl/vol24/iss2/6.

Comaroff, J. (1993), "The diseased heart of Africa: Medicine, colonialism, and the black body",

    in Lindenbaum, S. and Lock, M. (Eds.), *Knowledge, power, and practice: The*

    anthropology of medicine and everyday life, University of California Press, Berkeley,

    CA, pp. 305-329.

Couldry, N. and Mejias, U.A. (2019), "Data colonialism: Rethinking big data's relation to the

    contemporary subject", *Television & New Media*, Vol. 20 No.(4, pp. 336-349.

Crockett, D. (2022), "Racial oppression and racial projects in consumer markets: A racial

    formation theory approach", *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 49 No. 1, pp. 1-24.

Crotty, M., Germov, J., and Rodwell, G. (Eds.) (2000), "'A race for a place': Eugenics,

    Darwinism and social thought and practice in Australia", *Proceedings of the History &*

    Sociology of Eugenics Conference, University of Newcastle, Newcastle, Australia, pp.

    27-28.

Currell, S. and Cogdell, C. (Eds.). (2006), *Popular eugenics: National efficiency and American*

    mass culture in the 1930s, Ohio University Press, Columbus, OH.

Davis, J.F. (2018), "Selling whiteness?–A critical review of the literature on marketing and

    racism", *Journal of Marketing Management*, Vol. 34 No. 1-2, pp. 134-177.

Dikotter, F. (1998), "Race culture: Recent perspectives on the history of eugenics", *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 103 No. 2, pp. 467-478.

Dovchin, S. (2020), "The psychological damages of linguistic racism and international students in Australia", *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, Vol. 23 No. 2, pp. 1-15.

Eckhardt, G.M., Belk, R., Bradford, T.W., Dobscha, S., Ger, G. and Varman, R. (2022), "Decolonizing marketing", *Consumption Markets & Culture*, Vol. 25 No. 2, pp. 176-186.

Eckhardt, G.M., Dholakia, N. and Varman, R. (2013), "Ideology for the 10 billion: Introduction to globalization of marketing ideology", *Journal of Macromarketing*, Vol. 33 No. 1, pp. 7-12.

Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B.H. and Ziegler, J. (Eds.) (2009), *The origins of racism in the West*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, U.K.

Erichsen, C. and Olusoga, D. (2010), *The Kaiser's holocaust: Germany's forgotten genocide and the colonial roots of Nazism*, Faber & Faber, London, U.K.

Federici, S. (2004), *Caliban and the witch*, Autonomedia, New York, NY.

Fields, K. and Fields, B. (2012), *Racecraft*, Verso, London, U.K.

Francis, J.N. (2023), "Rescuing marketing from its colonial roots: A decolonial anti-racist agenda", *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, Vol. ahead-of-print No. ahead-of-print.

Fuller, S. and Lipinska, V. (2014), *The proactionary imperative: A foundation for transhumanism*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, U.K.

Gabriel, J. (1994), *Racism, culture, markets*, Routledge, New York, NY.

Gasman, D. (1971), *Scientific origins of National Socialism*, Routledge, New York, NY.

Giroux, H.A. (1993), "Consuming social change: The 'United Colors of Benetton'", *Cultural Critique*, Vol. 26, pp. 5-32.

Giroux, H.A. (2003), "Spectacles of race and pedagogies of denial: Anti-black racist pedagogy under the reign of neoliberalism", *Communication Education*, Vol. 52 No. 3-4, pp. 191-211.

Goldberg, D.T. (2009), *The threat of race: Reflections on racial neoliberalism*, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY.

Gray, M. L. and Suri, S. (2019), *Ghost work: How to stop Silicon Valley from building a new global underclass*, Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, Boston, MA.

Grier, S.A. (2020), "Marketing inclusion: A social justice project for diversity education", *Journal of Marketing Education*, Vol. 42 No. 1, pp. 59-75.

Hao, K. (2022). Artificial intelligence is creating a new colonial world order, *MIT Technology Review*, https://www.technologyreview.com/2022/04/19/1049592/artificial-intelligence-colonialism/.

Hickel, J., Sullivan, D., and Zoomkawala, H. (2021), "Plunder in the post-colonial era: Quantifying drain from the global south through unequal exchange, 1960-2018", *New Political Economy*, Vol. 26 No. 6, pp. 1030-1047.

Hong, G.K. (2015), Neoliberalism, *Critical Ethnic Studies*, Vol. 1 No. 1, 56-67.

Hund, W. D., Pickering, M. and Ramamurthy, A. (2013), *Colonial advertising & commodity racism, Vol. 4*, L.I.T. Verlag Münster, Zurich, Switzerland.

Huxley, J. (1957), *New Bottles for New Wine*, Chatto & Windus, London, U.K.

Jackson Sow, M. (2009), "Neo-colonialism, same old racism: A critical analysis of the United States' shift toward colorblindness as a tool for the protection of the American colonial

empire and white supremacy", *Berkeley Journal of African-American Law & Policy*, Vol. 11 No. 1, pp. 156-192.

Johnson, G.D., Thomas, K.D., Harrison, A.K. and Grier, S.A. (Eds.) (2019). *Race in the marketplace: Crossing critical boundaries*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, U.K.

Kanai, A. and Gill, R (2019), "Affirmative advertising and the mediated feeling rules of neoliberalism", in Meyers, M. (Ed.), *Neoliberalism and the media*, Routledge, New York, NY, pp.131-146.

Kendi, I.X. (2023), *How to be an antiracist,* One World, New York, NY.

Kumar, D. (2012), *Islamophobia and the politics of empire*, Haymarket Books, Chicago, IL.

Leak, R.L., McNeil, K.R. and Crockett, D. (2021), "Does history really matter: Investigating historical branded executions' effects on contemporary consumer attitudes", *Journal of Consumer Affairs*, Vol. 55, No. 2, pp. 445-463.

Malik, A.Z. and Paswan, A. (2023), "Linguistic racism in inter-culture service encounter", *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, Vol. ahead-of-print No. ahead-of-print.

Martínez, M.E., Nirenberg, D. and Torres, M.H. (Eds.) (2012), *Race and blood in the Iberian World, Vol.3*, LIT Verlag Münster, Zurich, Switzerland.

McClintock, A. (2020), "Soft-soaping empire: Commodity racism and imperial advertising", in Fraser, M. and Greco, M. (Eds.), *The body,* Routledge, New York, NY, pp. 271-276.

Melamed, J. (2006), "The spirit of neo-liberalism: From racial liberalism to neoliberal multiculturalism", *Social Text*, Vol. 24 No. 4, pp. 1-24.

Mirzaei, A., Wilkie, D.C. and Siuki, H. (2022), "Woke brand activism authenticity or the lack of it", *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 139, pp. 1-12.

Mitchell, N.A., Stovall, T. and Avalos, D. (2023), "Representation of women of color on the covers of the top three fashion magazines: A content analysis", *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, Vol. ahead-of-print No. ahead-of-print.

Mohamed, S., Png, M-T. and Isaac, W. (2020), "Decolonial A.I.: Decolonial theory as sociotechnical foresight in artificial intelligence", *Philosophy & Technology,* Vol. 33, pp. 659-684.

Mukherjee, R. and Banet-Weiser, S. (Eds.) (2012), *Commodity activism: Cultural resistance in neoliberal times*, N.Y.U. Press, New York, NY.

Orr, W., Henne, K., Lee, A., Harb, J.I. and Alphonso, F.C. (2023), "Necrocapitalism in the gig economy: The case of platform food couriers in Australia, *Antipode*, Vol. 55 No. 1, pp. 200-221.

Osterhammel, J. and Petersson, N. (2005), *Globalization: A short history* (D. Geyer, Trans.), Princeton University Press, Princeton, NJ.

Patterson, O. (1991), *Freedom in the making of Western culture*, I. B. Tauris, London, U.K.

Potts, R.G. (1997), "The social construction and social marketing of the 'dangerous black man'", *Journal of African American Studies*, Vol. 2 No. 4, pp. 11-24.

Ramamurthy, A. (2017), *Imperial persuaders: Images of Africa and Asia in British advertising*, Manchester University Press, Manchester, U.K.

Ramamurthy, A. and Wilson, K. (2013), "'Come and join the freedom lovers!': Racism, appropriation and resistance in advertising", in Hund, W.D., Pickering, M. and Ramamurthy, A. (Eds.), Commodity racism and colonial advertising, Racism Yearbook 2013, L.I.T. Verlag Münster, Zurich, Switzerland, pp. 69-94.

Randall, V.R. (1996), "Slavery, segregation, and racism: Trusting the health care system ain't always easy! An African American perspective on bioethics", *St. Louis Public Health Law Review*, Vol. 15 No. 2, pp. 191-235.

Rodrigues, L., Hemais, M.W. and Costa, A. (2023), "The 40 years of discourse on racism in the Brazilian advertising self-regulation system", *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, Vol. ahead-of-print No. ahead-of-print.

Rosen, C. (2004), *Preaching eugenics: Religious leaders and the American eugenics movement*, Oxford University Press, Oxford, U.K.

Shabbir, H.A., Hyman, M.R., Reast, J. and Palihawadana, D. (2014), "Deconstructing subtle racist imagery in television ads", *Journal of Business Ethics*, Vol. 123 No. 3, pp. 421-436.

Shabbir, H., Hyman, M.R., Dean, D. and Dahl, S. (2020), "'Freedom through marketing' is not doublespeak", *Journal of Business Ethics*, Vol. 164, pp. 227-241.

Shah, C.Q. (2015), *Sex ed, segregated: The quest for sexual knowledge in progressive-era America (Vol. 6)*, Boydell & Brewer, Rochester, NY.

Shome, R. (2011), "'Global motherhood': The transnational intimacies of white femininity", *Critical Studies in Media Communication,* Vol. 28 No. 5, pp. 388-406.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T (2015), "Language rights", in Wright, W. E., Boun, S. and García, O. (Eds.), *The handbook of bilingual and multilingual education*, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, pp. 185-202.

Stephens, D.P. and Philips, L.D. (2003), "Freaks, gold diggers, divas, and dykes: The sociohistorical development of adolescent African American women's sexual scripts", Sexuality & Culture, Vol. 7, 3-49.

Tadajewski, M. (2012), "Character analysis and racism in marketing theory and practice", *Marketing Theory*, Vol. 12 No. 4, pp. 485-508.

Tilley, L. and Shilliam, R. (2018), "Raced markets: An introduction", *New Political Economy,* Vol. 23 No. 5, pp. 534-543.

van Tine, S. (2021), "The problem of woke capitalism", in McManus, M. (Eds.), Liberalism and socialism, Palgrave studies in classical liberalism, Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, Switzerland, pp. 217-232.

Turda, M. (2010), *Modernism and eugenics,* Palgrave Macmillan, London, U.K.

Turner, J.S. (2011), "Sex and the spectacle of music videos: An examination of the portrayal of race and sexuality in music videos", *Sex Roles*, Vol. 64 No.3-4, pp. 173-191.

Thomas, K.D., Davis, J.F., Wilson, J.A. and Sobande, F. (2020), "Repetition or reckoning: Confronting racism and racial dynamics in 2020", *Journal of Marketing Management,* Vol. 36 No. 13-14, pp. 1153-1168.

Varman, R. (2018), "Violence, markets and marketing", *Journal of Marketing Management,* Vol. 34 No. 11-12, pp. 903-912.

Vredenburg, J., Kapitan, S., Spry, A. and Kemper, J.A. (2020), "Brands taking a stand: Authentic brand activism or woke washing?" *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, Vol. 39 No. 4, pp. 444-460.

Weaver, S. (2011), "Liquid racism and the ambiguity of Ali G", *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, Vol. 14 No. 3, pp. 249-264.

Weir, T. (Ed.) (2012), *Monism: Science, philosophy, religion, and the history of a worldview*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, U.K.

Yan, T. and Hyman, M.R. (2021), "How can we minimize visual stereotypes in ads*?" Journal of*

Current Issues & Research in Advertising, Vol. 43 No. 2, pp. 185-199.