



City Research Online

City, University of London Institutional Repository

Citation: Lingas, A. (2020). Christian Liturgical Chant and the Musical Reorientation of Arvo Pärt. In: Bouteneff, P., Engelhardt, J. & Saler, R. (Eds.), Christian Liturgical Chant and the Musical Reorientation of Arvo Pärt. (pp. 220-231). New York, USA: Fordham University Press. ISBN 9780823289769

This is the accepted version of the paper.

This version of the publication may differ from the final published version.

Permanent repository link: <https://openaccess.city.ac.uk/id/eprint/21531/>

Link to published version:

Copyright: City Research Online aims to make research outputs of City, University of London available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the author(s) and/or copyright holders. URLs from City Research Online may be freely distributed and linked to.

Reuse: Copies of full items can be used for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge. Provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.

City Research Online:

<http://openaccess.city.ac.uk/>

publications@city.ac.uk

Christian Liturgical Chant and the Musical Reorientation of Arvo Pärt
Alexander Lingas

Arvo Pärt has often said that Gregorian chant played a seminal role in the process of artistic and spiritual reorientation that followed *Credo* (1968), his last major essay in musical collage, and his consolidation of a new compositional approach in a series of works presented under the rubric 'Tintinnabuli' in a concert held in Tallinn on October 27, 1976.¹ The composer and his wife have also described these eight years as period of near total compositional 'silence' during which Arvo sought to overcome a creative impasse through immersing himself in sacred monophony and polyphony from the pre-modern West. Out of this emerged the revelation of Tintinnabuli, a compositional technique founded on a two-part texture in which a melodic 'M-voice' is accompanied by a 'T-voice' arpeggiating a triad built on the home note of the governing tonality.² Pärt has strengthened the narrative of a mainly silent period of study by retaining in his catalogue of authorized music only a single large-scale work from this time, namely the *Third Symphony* (1971), the polyphonic writing and archaic cadences of which witness to his interest in medieval and Renaissance music.

In his pioneering 1997 monograph, Paul Hillier accepted 1968–76 as a period of compositional silence, even as he acknowledged that "Pärt wrote reams of stylistic and technical studies resulting from his exploration of early music; he also continued to support

¹ Notably Martin Elste, "An Interview with Arvo Pärt," *Fanfare* 11 March/April (1988), <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/article/an-interview-with-arvo-part/>; Roman Brotbeck and Roland Wächter, "Lernen, Die Stille Zu Hören: Ein Gespräch Mit Dem Estnischen Komponisten Arvo Pärt," *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 151, no. 3 (1990): 14-15; Enzo Restagno et al., *Arvo Pärt in Conversation*, trans. Robert J. Crow, Estonian Literature Series (Champaign, Dublin and London: Dalkey Archive Press, 2012), 18 and 28; Arthur Lublow, "The Sound of Spirit," *The New York Times*, 15 October 2010; Jordi Savall, "A Conversation with Arvo Pärt. Translated from the French by Taylor Davis-Van Atta and Katherine Linton," *Music and Literature* 1 (2012): 7. Pärt also describes his formative encounter with Gregorian chant in Dorian Supin's film *24 Preludes for a Fugue*, a scene discussed in Laura Dolp, "Arvo Pärt in the Marketplace," in *The Cambridge Companion to Arvo Pärt*, ed. Andrew Shenton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 183; Immo Mikhelson, "A Narrow Path to the Truth: Arvo Pärt and The 1960s and 1970s in Soviet Estonia," in *The Cambridge Companion to Arvo Pärt*, ed. Andrew Shenton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 27.

² This nomenclature, now standard in the field, is from Paul Hillier, *Arvo Pärt*, Oxford Studies of Composers (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), 92–93.

himself and his family by writing film music, though only until 1974."³ Claiming "that in the eyes (or ears) of most people, it is the influence of early music that has had the most readily discernible impact on his style," Hillier then attempted in some detail to demonstrate how Pärt's Tintinnabuli music was indeed "rooted in plainsong" by indicating elements it held in common with medieval Latin plainchant and organum, including procedures for its generation from sacred text, evocations of responsorial chanting, and use of drones.⁴ Peter Phillips questioned the strength of these associations in a sarcastically titled-review ("Holy Minimalism!"), remarking that

Apart from the use of a drone, and the coincident employment of the same notation for the two, there is little apparent connection between the quoted examples of Pärt's music and the early music on which it is supposed to be based. This is just one example among many of forcing too much on Pärt's writing. The more obvious truth, for better or worse, is that Pärt's style is a style fashioned for modern use.⁵

One with may agree with Phillips that Tintinnabuli is inescapably a product of our own age without, however, severing its links to plainsong. Although Pärt has rarely quoted historic chant melodies in his Tintinnabuli works,⁶ many of their professional and lay listeners have perceived them as somehow extending pre-existing traditions of monophonic sacred song, especially those of Gregorian chant. Musicologists, for example, have often noted stylistic parallels between the M- voices of Tintinnabuli works and plainsong melodies,⁷ while Paul Hillier has counseled performers that experience with plainchant is

³ Ibid., 66.

⁴ Ibid., 77–85.

⁵ Peter Phillips, "Holy Minimalism!," *The New Republic*, Dec 01 1997, 52.

⁶ Exceptions are the introit *Statuit ei Dominus*, which frames Tintinnabuli music with quotations of the Gregorian version and *Da pacem*, which features the melody of the Gregorian antiphon as a cantus firmus in the alto voice. In addition to the Pärt's discussion of the former in Restagno (*Pärt in Conversation*, 28.), see Andrew Shenton, *Arvo Pärt's Resonant Texts: Choral and Organ Music 1956-2015* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), 150–51 and 236–38.

⁷ For example, Leopold Brauneiss, "Tintinnabuli: An Introduction," in *Arvo Pärt in Conversation*, ed. Enzo Restagno, Estonian Literature Series (Champaign, Dublin and London: Dalkey Archive Press, 2012), 124; Constantin Gröhn, *Dieter Schnebel Und Arvo Pärt: Komponisten Als "Theologen"* (Münster: Lit, 2006), 159;

invaluable for rendering Pärt's vocal music.⁸ Meanwhile in popular discourse the sound and spiritual ethos of his music are regularly conflated with those of Gregorian chant as now commonly understood, an identification that has contributed to the highly problematic placement of Pärt's Tintinnabuli works within a category of "mystical minimalism."⁹ Finally, there is the sheer consistency with which the composer has insisted that Gregorian chant played a significant role in starting and then guiding his journey toward Tintinnabuli.

Working in the spirit of recent scholarship that has enriched our understanding of change and continuity leading up to, across, and beyond Pärt's nominally 'silent' period of 1968–76,¹⁰ I will devote the main body of this chapter to reconsidering his relationship to Christian plainchant. Recollections by Arvo and Nora Pärt will provide context for a preliminary report on a large body of monophony that the composer wrote as musical and devotional exercises in eleven notebooks dated from February to November 1976, a period during which the first works in the Tintinnabuli style were completed and publicly performed.¹¹ Some brief observations of ways in which these melodies are, despite Pärt's

Oliver Kautny, *Arvo Pärt Zwischen Ost Und West: Rezeptionsgeschichte*, M & P Schriftenreihe Für Wissenschaft Und Forschung (Stuttgart: Metzler, 2002), 93, 214, 23 and 46–49; Olga Valerievna Osetskaja, "Священное Слово В Музыке А. Пярта" (Kandidat [Ph.D.] diss., Нижегородская Государственная Консерватория им. М.И. Глинки, 2002), 100–2; Svetlana Savenko, "Musica Sacra of Arvo Pärt," in «*Ex Oriente...*»: *Ten Composers from the Former Ussr : Viktor Suslin, Dmitry Smirnov, Arvo Pärt, Yury Kasparov, Galina Ustvol'skaya, Nikolai Sidel'nikov, Elena Firsova, Vladimir Martynov, Andrei Eshpai, Boris Chaikovsky*, ed. Valeria Tsenova, *Studia Slavica Musicologica* 25 (Berlin: Ernst Kuhn, 2002), 165; Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 118 and, *passim*, 36–99.

⁸ Hillier, Choral works essay Paul Hillier, "Some Observations on the Performance of Arvo Pärt's Choral Music," in *The Ashgate Research Companion to Minimalist and Postminimalist Music*, ed. Keith Potter and Kyle Gann (Farnham: Ashgate Publishing, 2013), 390.

⁹ Kautny, *Pärt Zwischen Ost Und West*. [PAGES]

¹⁰ Peter Bouteneff, for example, has shed light on the theological and devotional sources that inspired the composer during these eight years (and beyond) in *Arvo Pärt: Out of Silence* (Yonkers, New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2015). Other scholars have revealed aspects of continuity across Pärt's career, even to the point of re-evaluating the extent to which 1968–1976 was actually was a period of compositional silence. Particularly notable in this regard are two doctoral theses: Mark Eric John Vuorinen, "Arvo Pärt's Serial and Tintinnabuli Works: A Continuum of Process" (D.M.A., University of Toronto (Canada), 2014); Christopher Jonathan May, "System, Gesture, Rhetoric: Contexts for Rethinking Tintinnabuli in the Music of Arvo Pärt, 1960-1990" (D.Phil. Thesis, University of Oxford, 2016) *ibid*.

¹¹ Varying in size from 18 to 85 folios, these are notebooks No. 5 (4–29 February 1976 [the year was changed on the cover to 1975, but Toomas Schvak has confirmed that 1976 is correct]), No. 6 (1–31 March 1976), No. 7 (1–15 April 1976), No. 8 (16 April–20 May 1976), No. 9 (20–25 May 1976), No. 10 (26 May–5 June 1976), No. 11 (6–12 June 1976), No. 13 (1–16 July 1976), No. 14 (17–31 July 1976), and No. 16 (3 September–27 November 1976). Copies of were graciously made available to me for study at the Arvo Pärt Centre in

intense study of Gregorian chant, *unlike* those found in historic repertoires of Christian liturgical song will lead me to identify some ways in which the Tintinnabuli works that follow them chronologically manifest congruencies with plainchant. My aim in so doing is not to compile a list of musical features borrowed consciously or unconsciously from the traditions of Latin, Byzantine or Slavonic liturgical singing (many of which have in any case been noted previously by other scholars), but to suggest that in Tintinnabuli emerged a musical system that in some ways recreates by different means some of their organizational procedures.

Pärt as a Student and Composer of Chant

Pärt is unsure of exactly when and where it was that he heard the recording of Gregorian chant that suggested a route out of his creative impasse might be sought in the music of the distant past,¹² but in interviews since the late 1980s he has not wavered in his conviction that the encounter was for him decisive. Speaking in 2000 to Jordi Savall, he recalled that

All I know is that when I heard Gregorian chant for the first time, I must have been mature enough, in one way or another, to be able to appreciate such musical richness. At that moment I felt at once utterly deprived and rich. Utterly naked, too. I felt like the prodigal son returning to his father's home. I had nothing, I had accomplished nothing. The methods I had used before had not allowed me to say what I wanted to say with music, yet I did not know any others. At that moment, my previous work seemed like an attempt to carry water in a sieve. I was absolutely certain: everything I had done until then I would never do again. For several years I had made various

Laulasmaa, Estonia on 15 and 16 January 2018. My thanks to Toomas Schvak for kindly fielding queries from afar and, especially, to Kristina Kõrver for her extraordinary efforts to ensure that my short visit was as enjoyable and productive as possible. I am also grateful to Arvo Pärt, for suggesting that I look at the 1991 notebooks, and to Nora Pärt for a wide-ranging conversation conducted, with the assistance of Ms Kõrver, in multiple languages.

¹² Agreeing with one interviewer that the encounter happened around 1970 (Savall, "A Conversation," 8.), Pärt has described it as occurring in a record (Brotbeck and Wächter, "Lernen," 18; Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*. Restagno 18) or book (Supin, *24 Preludes*) store, although it is possible that he was listening to a radio broadcast (Lublow, "The Sound of Spirit.").

attempts to compose using collage techniques, mainly with the music of Bach. But all of that was more a sort of compromise than something I carried in my flesh. Then this encounter with Gregorian music... I had to start again from scratch. It took me seven, eight years before I felt the least bit of confidence—a period during which I listened to and studied a lot of early music, of course.¹³

In likening himself the Prodigal Son of the biblical parable, Pärt was referring obliquely to the inseparability of his musical and spiritual motivations for immersing himself in music of the pre-modern West.¹⁴ According to Arvo and Nora Pärt, this studied not only Gregorian chant, for which a copy of the *Liber usualis* was his main resource,¹⁵ but also polyphonic music including that of "the Notre Dame school, then Machaut, Franco-Flemish music, Obrecht, Ockeghem, and Josquin" eventually supplemented by later Renaissance masters including Palestrina and, especially, Victoria.¹⁶ As we noted above, influence of the old polyphonic masters soon surfaced in the *Third Symphony*, a work that left Pärt "dissatisfied" with being so obviously indebted to musical history but "encouraged [him] to go on exploring."¹⁷ Central to this exploration were efforts to divine the "cosmic secret...hidden in the art of combining two, three notes" that gave early music, especially Gregorian chant, the "life-giving power" that he instinctively felt it possessed.¹⁸ To accomplish this, he complemented his study of historic chants with the composition of a substantial body of monophony that he recorded in the notebooks that serve him as a chronicle of his musical and non-musical thoughts.¹⁹

¹³ Savall, "A Conversation," 7–8.

¹⁴ Ibid., 8; see also Brotbeck and Wächter, "Lernen," 15; Lublow, "The Sound of Spirit."; and Jamie McCarthy, "An Interview with Arvo Pärt," *Contemporary Music Review* 12, no. 2 (1995): 59.

¹⁵ Brotbeck and Wächter, "Lernen," 15; and Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 28.

¹⁶ McCarthy, "An Interview," 59; Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 33–35.

¹⁷ *Pärt in Conversation*, 29.

¹⁸ Elste, "An Interview with Arvo Pärt"; Lublow, "The Sound of Spirit."

¹⁹ Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 29. It is important not to conflate Pärt's study of Gregorian chant with his compositional exercises in monophony and speak of him as "copying out" psalms from the *Liber Usualis* (Vuorinen, "Arvo Pärt's Serial and Tintinnabuli," 60.) or "fill[ing] his notebooks with ancient melodies" (Lublow, "The Sound of Spirit.").

The eleven notebooks dating from February to November 1976 that I examined in January 2018 show that Pärt was still intensely engaged in the writing of monophonic exercises even he was forging the techniques of *Tintinnabuli*. Although time did not permit a full inventory, my impression was that the number of folios Pärt devoted to monophony in them exceeds that allotted sketches composed in multiple parts or presented in graphic form.²⁰ The indivisibility of music and religion for Pärt is evident from the fact that devotional texts account for approximately one fourth of the material recorded in these notebooks. Alongside texts in Estonian and a few in Latin one finds a significant body of writing in Russian and Church Slavonic including prayers, biblical citations, and passages from spiritual authorities ranging chronologically from Athanasius (fourth century) to Seraphim of Sarov (1754–1833).²¹

Pärt's melodic experiments are for the most part wordless, with the exceptions including a *Kyrie* from the mass ordinary of the Roman rite²² and a set of sketches setting the *Jesus Prayer* in Slavonic that begin with recitation on a single pitch (E) followed by more tuneful renderings (some with melismas) with melodic finals on G, F-sharp and E.²³ Although many Pärt's exercises employ key signatures with one or two sharps, his melodies are mainly diatonic and more tonal than modal, with a preference for minor keys inflected with occasional leading tones. Their rhythmic profiles show considerable variety yet are essentially of two main types, either Solesmes-style 'free-rhythm' or ternary patterns recalling the mensural chant and early polyphony of the medieval Latin West. There is a similar variety of melodic contours and ranges, with some tunes moving predominantly in stepwise motion over a narrow range and others featuring many leaps roving over a wide ambitus.

²⁰ In some cases (for example, folios 23r–30v of Notebook 5) the dividing line between monophonic exercises to which of additional voices have intermittently been added and sketches conceived at the outset as being in multiple parts is not always clear.

²¹ For example, respectively, Notebook 8, f. 2v and 42r.

²² Notebook 6, f. 22r–22v, including some passages with the addition of a second voice.

²³ Notebook 10, f. 29r–44v. Additional musical settings of the *Jesus Prayer* occur in Notebooks 13, 14 and 16.

Notebooks 8, 9 and 10 contain Pärt's most ambitious exercise in monophony: an effort accomplished between April and June 1976 to compose in sequence a melody corresponding to each of the 150 psalms in the Bible. Nora Pärt has identified this experiment as one of a number of attempts by her husband at that time to "develop his spontaneity" that also included writing melodies prompted by sketches he made upon observing "flocks of birds."²⁴ The composer has described his working method and its results as follows:

I read a psalm and filled a whole page, without thinking much about it, in the hope that there might be some sort of connection between what I wrote. Then I got on with reading the next psalm. I'm sure that between the psalm and my melody there was no connection at all. At least I didn't notice any. However, I still hoped for some sort of osmosis, and so I went on and repeated the same process with one hundred and fifty psalms.²⁵

Unlike Pärt's later *Tintinnabuli* settings of psalms, there is indeed no evident correlation in length between these exercises in monody and the texts of their corresponding psalms, which are indicated in the notebooks by superscriptions. These superscriptions move in sequence through the Psalter and are normally followed by a single chant, but in some cases multiple chants or other kinds of sketches are recorded before the next psalm heading. The melodies that arose from this extended experiment are predominantly notated in E-minor and in free rhythm, although some chants feature short or extended mensural passages.²⁶ They exhibit the full range of conjunct and disjunct melodic contours evident in his other essays in monody from 1976, yet with a tendency toward extreme ranges and frequent juxtapositions of stepwise and angular writing.

²⁴ Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 29. See also Savall, "A Conversation," 13–14.

²⁵ Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 29.

²⁶ For example, the melodies corresponding to Psalms 49 and 50 both feature brief mensural passages (Notebook 9, f. 49v–50r).

Pärt has voiced deep dissatisfaction with the body of monody that he composed before consolidating his Tintinnabuli style, going so far as to describe it in interviews as "mad things," "dead exercises," and "absolutely meaningless things."²⁷ Looking upon these melodies from the perspective of a scholar and performer of historical and living traditions of Christian plainchant, I was forced to conclude that he was for the most part right about their musical value. Other than a few items that stylistically resemble traditional chants,²⁸ Pärt's melodies do not demonstrate a musical logic comparable to that evident to listeners and analysts in the central repertoires of notated Byzantine, Latin and Slavonic liturgical chant. His chants, especially the psalm exercises, also fare badly when judged against the products of spontaneous composition within living Arab, Persian and Indian traditions of monophonic music. Lacking the musical grammar provided by the modal systems of these traditions, Pärt wrote melodies that ventured capriciously into extreme registers without adequate preparation or development. Not unexpectedly for composer reared in tonal harmony, in which "chords become decisive codeterminants" for melody,²⁹ he evidently did not know how logically to develop and sustain musical interest in a single line in the manner of either melismatic Christian chant or an instrumental *taksim*. Bearing this in mind, one may understand better why Nora Pärt reports that the composition of these exercises was marked by suffering, for her husband seems to have been unable to master through the medium of monophony the "cosmic secret" he had perceived in Gregorian chant "hidden in the art of combining two, three notes."³⁰

²⁷ Savall, "A Conversation," 13–14. The composer described this music to me in similar terms during my January 2018 visit to Laulasmaa. Elsewhere he having also been unhappy, albeit primarily for timbral reasons, when members of Andres Mustonen's early music ensemble *Hortus Musicus* played some of these "melodies on the violin or crumhorn, particularly with the latter instrument" (Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 32–33.).

²⁸ For example, a melody in F major dated 29 February 1976 (Notebook 5, f. 38r) in the style of a Gregorian antiphon.

²⁹ William Thomson, "From Sounds to Music: The Contextualizations of Pitch," *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 21, no. 3 (2004): 449.

³⁰ Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 30; Elste, "An Interview with Arvo Pärt".

Concluding Reflections on Tintinnabuli and Christian Plainchant

Having reached an impasse in his explorations of monophony, Pärt "discovered and developed" in Tintinnabuli, as Brauneiss has observed, a compositional means "to recreate the effect which Gregorian [chant] is capable of producing on the listener of today."³¹ Based in part on a quarter century of experience with performers and audiences as Musical Director of the vocal ensemble Cappella Romana, however, I would broaden this perception of commonality to extend beyond Gregorian chant to embrace other ancient forms of Latin liturgical song, Byzantine and Slavonic chant, and some repertoires of pre-modern polyphony. Significantly, for some of us cognisance of these affinities seems to have been independent of the profound sonic differences between renderings of Pärt's Tintinnabuli vocal works by voices trained in the English or Scandinavian choral traditions (a stylistic norm promulgated by their 'authorised' recordings on the ECM label), and microtonally inflected renderings of chant rooted in received traditions of Byzantine performance practice. By way of a conclusion, I would like to indicate briefly how Pärt, informed by his study of the monophony and early polyphony of the pre-modern West yet unwilling simply to recapitulate what his wife called "cold, dead rules form years gone by,"³² ended up creating in Tintinnabuli a musical system that grounded his melodic imagination in procedures that were in some respects congruent with those governing historic traditions of Christian plainchant.³³

Nora Pärt has observed that the fundamental two-part texture of tintinnabulation provided her husband with a new way to regulate musical tension, something that we have noted proved difficult for him when writing bare monody. Although analysts have

³¹ Brauneiss, "Tintinnabuli: An Introduction," 117.

³² Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 29.

³³ Cf. Sean McClowry's observation that Pärt "was interested in returning back to the origins of classical music to reinvent new alternatives to the conventions that were set in motion at this important crossroads in music history" ("The Song of the Convert: Religious Conversion and Its Impact on the Music of Franz Liszt, Arvo Pärt, and John Coltrane" (Ph.D., Princeton University, 2012), 43–44.) and Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 34.

subsequently developed her insight, demonstrating how Pärt alternates tension and release through such techniques as the variation of intervallic density,³⁴ it is worth recalling the Pärts' insistence that that in Tintinnabuli the melodic M-voice and accompanying arpeggiation of the tonic in the T-voice should also be considered as grounded in a single reality, so that $1+1=1$.³⁵ John Roeder confirmed the underlying unity of tintinnabulating voices when he showed how "Pärt's strict system makes harmony into an aspect of melody,"³⁶ a formulation that when inverted recalls the Aristoxenian conception of harmony "as a formative participant of monophonic music,"³⁷ a theoretical notion inherited by the monophonic traditions of the Late Antique and medieval Mediterranean, including Christian plainchant. William Thomson has provided a way of understanding the acoustical and cognitive reasons for such functional equivalence in a cross-cultural study of how melody is governed by "tonality frames," which he defines as "a conception of organization that ties the spectral content of the single tone to the chord and to melody, both bearing in common the properties of sonance and root."³⁸

Viewed from this perspective, Tintinnabuli provided Pärt with a way to discipline his melodic imagination that, while retaining some elements of Western traditions of tonal polyphony and harmony,³⁹ in other respects resembles plainchant and certain other ancient traditions of monophony. These resemblances include:

1. The setting of melodies within areas of tonal stability confirmed by the melodic gravity exerted by modal finals that, in some traditions such as Byzantine chant, are made audible as drones. In Pärt's Tintinnabuli music the work of sounding the

³⁴ For example, Carol Leonore Matthews Whiteman, "'Passio': The Iconography of Arvo Pärt" (Ph.D. diss., City University of New York, 1997), 48–117; and Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 43–46.

³⁵ Restagno et al., *Pärt in Conversation*, 30–31.

³⁶ John Roeder, "Transformational Aspects of Arvo Pärt's Tintinnabuli Music," *Journal of Music Theory* 55, no. 1 (2011).

³⁷ Thomson, "From Sounds to Music," 442.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 431.

³⁹ On the retention of common practice harmony in Pärt's music, see Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 37 and 42.

prevailing tonality is usually accomplished by one or more T-voices that in some cases are supplemented or supplanted by an actual drone.⁴⁰

2. The use of logogenic procedures for the generation of melody, the strict application of which in such early Tintinnabuli works as the *Missa Syllabica* and the *Passio* served to create austere stepwise vocal lines that constantly returned to their tonal homes. Encapsulated by the composer in the phrase "the words write my music," these techniques serve as comparatively simpler substitutes for the mechanisms governing successions of musical formulas and their application to text evident in musically developed genres of Christian plainchant.⁴¹ Additional technical parallels between Pärt's melodic writing and liturgical chant have been noted in his creation of melismatic chant in the *Te Deum* by interpolating T-voice formulas within stepwise logogenic lines and a fondness for rhetorical gestures that becomes more pronounced as he develops the expressive potential of Tintinnabuli.⁴²
3. The creation of large-scale structures from combinations of techniques held in common with chant, especially that belonging to highly melismatic genres in which musical considerations eclipse text in the structuring of form, with others particular to Tintinnabuli, notable among which is the regulation of levels of dissonance between

⁴⁰ During our conversation in Laulasmaa, Nora Pärt endorsed the idea that the T-voice of tintinnabulation functions musically in a way comparable to the Byzantine tradition of *isokratema* (drone holding). Other scholars who have followed on from Pärt's labelling of the recorded drones in his *Te Deum* as "ison" to discuss more broadly the question of affinities between Byzantine *isokratema* and Tintinnabuli include Osetskaia, "Священное Слово В Музыке А. Пярта," 104; Savenko, "Musica Sacra," 165; Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 86 and 136–41.

⁴¹ Authors who have remarked on parallels between centonisation in liturgical chant and Pärt's logogenic melodic writing are Gröhn, *Dieter Schnebel Und Arvo Pärt*, 159; Osetskaia, "Священное Слово В Музыке А. Пярта," 100–01; and Nora Potemkina, "Современное Православное Богослужбное Пение И Духовная Музыка Рубежа Хх–Ххi Веков. Параллели И Пересечения," *Ученые записки РАМ имени Гнесиных* 3, no. 18 (2016). The literature on logogenic composition and centonization in Christian plainchant is vast. Two examples that discuss chant of the Roman rite are William T. Flynn, *Medieval Music as Medieval Exegesis* (Lanham, Md. and London: Scarecrow Press, 1999); and Emma Hornby, *Medieval Liturgical Chant and Patristic Exegesis : Words and Music in the Second-Mode Tracts* (Woodbridge: Woodbridge : Boydell Press, 2009).

⁴² Osetskaia, "Священное Слово В Музыке А. Пярта," 81–88; Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 136–41 and 97.

voices. In contrast to the goal-directed tonal structures that as Karol Berger has identified as characteristic of Western art music from the later eighteenth century onwards,⁴³ one finds both in works by Pärt and, for example, repertoires of melodically florid Byzantine chant the operation of what Cizmic has described as "process-driven stasis."⁴⁴ In such music moments of tension and release are certainly perceived, but serve ultimately to emphasise the stability or even identity of the points of musical arrival and departure in ways that highlight contrasts between human time and the eschatological experience of the perpetual heavenly liturgy.⁴⁵

Having reached the end of this chapter, there is neither space nor need, thanks to the work of other scholars, to append here a catalogue of minor congruencies between Pärt's published music and repertoires of Christian liturgical chant, especially Eastern Orthodox ones, that have proliferated since the 1990s.⁴⁶ Instead I shall simply convey some additional information regarding Pärt as a composer of chant that he personally brought to my attention during my January 2018 visit to the Arvo Pärt Centre. As I was examining his notebooks from 1976, he suggested that I also look at four notebooks from the summer of 1991 containing entries written in multiple locations—Berlin, Gent, Rome, Stockholm, Tolleshunt

⁴³ Karol Berger, *Bach's Cycle, Mozart's Arrow: An Essay on the Origins of Musical Modernity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007).

⁴⁴ Maria Cizmic, "Transcending the Icon: Spirituality and Postmodernism in Arvo Pärt's *Tabula Rasa* and *Spiegel Im Spiegel*," *Twentieth-Century Music* 5, no. 1 (2008): 75. I discuss examples of such chants from Byzantium in Alexander Lingas, "From Earth to Heaven: The Changing Soundscape of Byzantine Liturgy," in *Experiencing Byzantium: Papers from the 44th Spring Symposium of Byzantine Studies, Newcastle and Durham, April 2011*, ed. Claire Nesbitt and Mark Jackson, Society for the Promotion of Byzantine Studies Publications 18 (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2013).

⁴⁵ Pärt speaks of eternal nature of angelic music in Brotbeck and Wächter, "Lernen," 16. These ideas are explored further in Kevin C. Karnes, *Arvo Pärt's Tabula Rasa* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017), 52–55; Gröhn, *Dieter Schnebel Und Arvo Pärt*, 130; Patrick Revol, *Conception Orientale Du Temps Dans La Musique Occidentale Du Vingtième Siècle*, Collection Univers Musical (Paris: Harmattan, 2007), 182–84; Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 287; and Brunhilde Sonntag, "Das Problem Der Zeit in Der Tintinnabuli-Musik Arvo Pärts," in *Arvo Pärt – Rezeption Und Wirkung Seiner Musik: Vorträge Des Wuppertaler Symposiums 1999*, ed. Oliver Kautny, Osnabrücker Beiträge Zur Musik Und Musikerziehung 2 (Osnabrück: Electronic Publishing, 2001), 41–44.

⁴⁶ See, for example, Oliver Kautny, "«Alle Länder, in Ihrer Verschiedenheit, Sind Eins...»: Der Schein Des Orientalischen Bei Arvo Pärt," *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik (1991-)* 164, no. 2 (2003): 24–27; and Shenton, *Pärt's Resonant Texts*, 151–53, 215, and 25.

Knights (UK), and Zürich—that reflected his ascent to international prominence.⁴⁷ Their contents showed that he continued to use notebooks as a means to chart his musical and devotional life with quotations from spiritual authorities, the recording of personal observations, and the composition of musical sketches that include numerous instances of monophony displaying the familiar mix of freely and mensurally notated rhythms. Textless melodies abound, but so do settings of the Jesus Prayer and the exclamation "Lord, have mercy" in Slavonic, Estonian and even Greek. Perhaps the most significant difference between the monophony he composed in 1976 and that written in 1991 is that the newer melodies more closely resemble traditional Christian chant, a style that, as we have seen, he came to approximate in his public works thanks to the strictures of tintinnabulation.

- Berger, Karol. *Bach's Cycle, Mozart's Arrow: An Essay on the Origins of Musical Modernity*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007.
- Bouteneff, Peter. *Arvo Pärt: Out of Silence*. [in eng] Yonkers, New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2015.
- Brauneiss, Leopold. "Tintinnabuli: An Introduction." Translated by Robert J. Crow. In *Arvo Pärt in Conversation*, edited by Enzo Restagno. Estonian Literature Series, 107–62. Champaign, Dublin and London: Dalkey Archive Press, 2012.
- Brotbeck, Roman, and Roland Wächter. "Lernen, Die Stille Zu Hören: Ein Gespräch Mit Dem Estnischen Komponisten Arvo Pärt." *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 151, no. 3 (1990): 13–16.
- Cizmic, Maria. "Transcending the Icon: Spirituality and Postmodernism in Arvo Pärt's Tabula Rasa and Spiegel Im Spiegel." *Twentieth-Century Music* 5, no. 1 (2008): 45–78.
- Dolp, Laura. "Arvo Pärt in the Marketplace." In *The Cambridge Companion to Arvo Pärt*, edited by Andrew Shenton, 177–92. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Elste, Martin. "An Interview with Arvo Pärt." *Fanfare* 11 March/April (1988): 337–41. <https://www.arvopart.ee/en/arvo-part/article/an-interview-with-arvo-part/>.
- Flynn, William T. *Medieval Music as Medieval Exegesis*. Lanham, Md. and London: Scarecrow Press, 1999.
- Gröhn, Constantin. *Dieter Schnebel Und Arvo Pärt: Komponisten Als "Theologen"*. [in German] Münster: Lit, 2006.
- Hillier, Paul. *Arvo Pärt*. [in eng] Oxford Studies of Composers. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.

⁴⁷ No. 8 (June 1991), No. 9 (July 1991), No. 11 (July–August 1991), and No. 12 (August 1991).

- . "Some Observations on the Performance of Arvo Pärt's Choral Music." In *The Ashgate Research Companion to Minimalist and Postminimalist Music*, edited by Keith Potter and Kyle Gann, 389–92. Farnham: Ashgate Publishing, 2013.
- Hornby, Emma. *Medieval Liturgical Chant and Patristic Exegesis : Words and Music in the Second-Mode Tracts*. Woodbridge: Woodbridge : Boydell Press, 2009.
- Karnes, Kevin C. *Arvo Pärt's Tabula Rasa*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2017.
- Kautny, Oliver. "«Alle Länder, in Ihrer Verschiedenheit, Sind Eins...»: Der Schein Des Orientalischen Bei Arvo Pärt." *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik (1991-)* 164, no. 2 (2003): 24-27.
- . *Arvo Pärt Zwischen Ost Und West: Rezeptionsgeschichte*. [in ger] M & P Schriftenreihe Für Wissenschaft Und Forschung. Stuttgart: Metzler, 2002.
- Lingas, Alexander. "From Earth to Heaven: The Changing Soundscape of Byzantine Liturgy." In *Experiencing Byzantium: Papers from the 44th Spring Symposium of Byzantine Studies, Newcastle and Durham, April 2011*, edited by Claire Nesbitt and Mark Jackson. Society for the Promotion of Byzantine Studies Publications 18, 311–58. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2013.
- Lublow, Arthur. "The Sound of Spirit." *The New York Times*, 15 October 2010.
- Matthews Whiteman, Carol Leonore. "'Passio': The Iconography of Arvo Pärt." Ph.D. diss., City University of New York, 1997.
- May, Christopher Jonathan. "System, Gesture, Rhetoric: Contexts for Rethinking Tintinnabuli in the Music of Arvo Pärt, 1960-1990." D.Phil. Thesis, University of Oxford, 2016.
- McCarthy, Jamie. "An Interview with Arvo Pärt." *Contemporary Music Review* 12, no. 2 (1995): 55–64.
- McClowry, Sean. "The Song of the Convert: Religious Conversion and Its Impact on the Music of Franz Liszt, Arvo Pärt, and John Coltrane." Ph.D., Princeton University, 2012.
- Mihkelson, Immo. "A Narrow Path to the Truth: Arvo Pärt and The 1960s and 1970s in Soviet Estonia." In *The Cambridge Companion to Arvo Pärt*, edited by Andrew Shenton, 10–28. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Osetskaia, Olga Valerievna. "Священное Слово В Музыке А. Пярта." Kandidat [Ph.D.] diss., Нижегородская Государственная Консерватория им. М.И. Глинки, 2002.
- Phillips, Peter. "Holy Minimalism!" *The New Republic*, Dec 01 1997, 47-53.
- Potemkina, Nora. "Современное Православное Богослужebное Пение И Духовная Музыка Рубежа Хх–Ххi Веков. Параллели И Пересечения." *Ученые записки РАМ имени Гнесиных* 3, no. 18 (2016).
- Restagno, Enzo, Leopold Brauneiss, Saale Kareda, and Arvo Pärt. *Arvo Pärt in Conversation*. [in eng] Translated by Robert J. Crow. Estonian Literature Series. Champaign, Dublin and London: Dalkey Archive Press, 2012.
- Revol, Patrick. *Conception Orientale Du Temps Dans La Musique Occidentale Du Vingtième Siècle*. [in fre] Collection Univers Musical. Paris: Harmattan, 2007.
- Roeder, John. "Transformational Aspects of Arvo Pärt's Tintinnabuli Music." *Journal of Music Theory* 55, no. 1 (2011): 1-41.
- Savall, Jordi. "A Conversation with Arvo Pärt. Translated from the French by Taylor Davis-Van Atta and Katherine Linton." *Music and Literature* 1 (2012): 7–14.
- Savenko, Svetlana. "Musica Sacra of Arvo Pärt." Translated by Carolyn C. Dunlop. In «*Ex Oriente...*»: *Ten Composers from the Former Ussr : Viktor Suslin, Dmitry Smirnov, Arvo Pärt, Yury Kasparov, Galina Ustvolskaya, Nikolai Sidelnikov, Elena Firsova, Vladimir Martynov, Andrei Eshpai, Boris Chaikovsky*, edited by Valeria Tsenova. *Studia Slavica Musicologica* 25, 155–78. Berlin: Ernst Kuhn, 2002.

- Shenton, Andrew. *Arvo Pärt's Resonant Texts: Choral and Organ Music 1956-2015*. [in eng] Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018.
- Sonntag, Brunhilde. "Das Problem Der Zeit in Der Tintinnabuli-Musik Arvo Pärts." In *Arvo Pärt – Rezeption Und Wirkung Seiner Musik: Vorträge Des Wuppertaler Symposiums 1999*, edited by Oliver Kautny. Osnabrücker Beiträge Zur Musik Und Musikerziehung 2, 31–46. Osnabrück: Electronic Publishing, 2001.
- Thomson, William. "From Sounds to Music: The Contextualizations of Pitch." *Music Perception: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 21, no. 3 (2004): 431-56.
- Vuorinen, Mark Eric John. "Arvo Pärt's Serial and Tintinnabuli Works: A Continuum of Process." D.M.A., University of Toronto (Canada), 2014.