



City Research Online

City, University of London Institutional Repository

Citation: Pace, I. (2019). In Defence of Analytically-Informed Performance. Keynote Paper presented at the International encounters on Music Theory and Analysis Conference, 6 Nov 2019, São Paulo, Brazil.

This is the presentation version of the paper.

This version of the publication may differ from the final published version.

Permanent repository link: <https://openaccess.city.ac.uk/id/eprint/30386/>

Link to published version:

Copyright: City Research Online aims to make research outputs of City, University of London available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the author(s) and/or copyright holders. URLs from City Research Online may be freely distributed and linked to.

Reuse: Copies of full items can be used for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge. Provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.

City Research Online:

<http://openaccess.city.ac.uk/>

publications@city.ac.uk

In defence of AIP (Analytically-Informed Performance)

**Study Day on Analysis and Performance
City, University of London, 15 November 2019**

**Dr Ian Pace,
Senior Lecturer, Head of Performance
City, University of London
Ian.pace.1@city.ac.uk**

Nicholas Cook, *Beyond the Score: Music as Performance* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013)

And Rosen's take here on historically informed performance—which is not so different from the post-Taruskin consensus—might suggest a corresponding take on 'analytically informed performance'. Whereas in HIP the interaction between scholarship and performance has always taken place in the studio, rehearsal room, and concert hall, with scholars often serving as consultants to performers, interactions between theorists and performers have tended to take place on campus, on the scholar's turf: more than HIP, what I shall term AIP has been pursued within the contexts of academic epistemologies, modes of dissemination, and criteria for evaluation. (An obvious reason for this difference is that there is not a distinctive AIP audience, in the way there is an HIP one.) Two further comparisons should reinforce the point. The first may seem rather ironic, given my suggestion in Chapter 2 that the prescriptive nature of the page-to-stage approach resulted in part from the influence of composer-theorists such as Edward T. Cone. I am now suggesting that a useful model for the relationship between analysis and performance might be found in that between theory and composition. Composers who work within the context of academia are theoretically informed, but do not simply translate theory into composition, even (perhaps especially) when it is their own theory: they use it rather to open up previously unimagined possibilities, to spark ideas off, to react against, to play with, and so to forge a conception that is both sonic and personal. Performers do all of that, and the example of composition shows that the academy is capable of supporting epistemological pluralism. (p. 97)

Ian Pace, 'The New State of Play in Performance Studies', *Music & Letters*, vol. 98, no. 2 (May 2017)

- He [Cook] notes disparagingly that in the work of Wallace Berry, 'Practice is subordinated to theory', but of what performance is this not in some sense the case? What teachers preach and performers follow, even in a conservatoire, are 'theories'; the issue is the degree of critical reflection. Cook coins a term, 'analytically informed performance', or AIP, which he claims exists primarily on campuses and 'has been pursued within the contexts of academic epistemologies, modes of dissemination, and criteria for evaluation' (p. 97). This resembles another of his concepts: '[S]tructuralist performance, better known as modernist performance, the kind of performance in terms of which Schenker's writings on performance have been read, should be seen as a historical style, and not the paradigm for performance in general as which it has been widely represented in music-theoretical and pedagogical circles' (p. 87). I do not know what a non-'structuralist' performance would be; all performers in some sense articulate some structural aspects of a piece, whether wittingly or not. In chapter 7, Cook is sceptical as to whether 'large-scale structure' is 'the most productive place to look for the emergence of musical meaning' (p. 246), citing [Daniel] Leech-Wilkinson cautioning performers to be wary of music theorists. But every performer needs to make decisions about such long-range factors as relative dynamics, tempos, use of different sounds, and textures at strategic points. To maintain that analytical work could never fruitfully inform performers in these respects appears like bad conscience or even musicological anti-intellectualism. Tim Carter has written about students who think that other than simply 'playing the notes', all one needs is 'sincerity and reverence'; such students would be as dismissive of the work of Cook and his colleagues at CHARM [Centre for the History and Analysis of Recorded Music] as they would of the work that CHARM is keen to disregard.

Edward T. Cone, *Musical Form and Musical Performance* (1968)

- Focus initially on issues of timing.
- Scepticism towards 'ideal' of 'perfect' interpretation.
- Issues of musical diction
- Problems of stereotypical conceptions of composers and corresponding demands for performance.
- Generally non-didactic.

Wallace Berry, *Musical Structure and Performance* (1989)

- Much more extended book than Cone's.
- Careful not to deny value of more intuitive performance.
- Recognition of complex relationship between analysis and interpretive decisions.
- Key aspects of interpretation: tempo and its modification, and articulation.
- Key aspects of analysis: musical structure and *function* of particular events.
- Multiple levels of foreground, middleground, background.
- *'There is no single, one-and-only performance decision that can be dictated by an analytic observation.'*

Wallace Berry, *Musical Structure and Performance* (1989)

- Questions of correct pitch in works of Beethoven and Chopin.
- Voice-leading as guide to emphasis in a song of Hugo Wolf.
- Whether a written-out acceleration in a Beethoven symphony should be underlined and emphasised by a conductor?
- I argue that the interpreter might do something further – distinct from anything implied by the score, as caprice, or to add a dialectical perspective.

Eugene Narmour, 'On the Relationship of Analytical Theory to Performance and Interpretation' (1988)

- Tripartite model of interrelationship between composer, performer and listener.
- Arguments about Brahms Intermezzo op. 118, no. 1.

Brahms, Intermezzo op. 118 no. 1

1. Intermezzo

Allegro non assai, ma molto appassionato

The first system of the musical score for Brahms' Intermezzo op. 118 no. 1. It features a treble and bass clef. The treble clef part begins with a half note G4, followed by a half note F#4, and then a half note E4. The bass clef part starts with a half note C3, followed by a half note D3, and then a half note E3. The tempo marking 'Allegro non assai, ma molto appassionato' is positioned above the treble clef. The dynamic marking 'f' is placed below the first measure of the bass clef. The word 'espress' is written at the end of the system.

The second system of the musical score. The treble clef part continues with a half note D4, followed by a half note E4, and then a half note F#4. The bass clef part continues with a half note F3, followed by a half note G3, and then a half note A3. The dynamic marking 'f' is present at the beginning of the system.

The third system of the musical score. The treble clef part begins with a half note G4, followed by a half note F#4, and then a half note E4. The bass clef part continues with a half note B2, followed by a half note C3, and then a half note D3. The dynamic marking 'dim. rit.' is written above the first measure of the treble clef.

The fourth system of the musical score. The treble clef part begins with a half note D4, followed by a half note E4, and then a half note F#4. The bass clef part continues with a half note E3, followed by a half note F3, and then a half note G3. The dynamic marking 'f' is present at the beginning of the system.

The fifth system of the musical score. The treble clef part begins with a half note G4, followed by a half note F#4, and then a half note E4. The bass clef part continues with a half note A3, followed by a half note B3, and then a half note C4. The dynamic marking 'dim. rit.' is written above the first measure of the treble clef.

Writings of Nicholas Cook on analysis

- 1987 *A Guide to Musical Analysis*
- 1989 *Musical Analysis and the Listener*
- 1990 *Music, Imagination, and Culture*
- 1995 'The Conductor and the Theorist: Furtwängler, Schenker, and the First Movement of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony'. In *The Practice of Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation*, edited John Rink (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 105-125.
- 1996 *Analysis through Composition: Principles of the Classical Style*
- 1998 *Analyzing Musical Multimedia*
- 1999 'Analysing Performance and Performing Analysis'. In *Rethinking Music*, edited Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 239-61. Modified versions of the same: 'Words about Music, or Analysis versus Performance'. In *Theory into Practice: Composition, Performance and the Listening Experience* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 1999), pp. 9-52; 'Music as Performance'. In *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, edited Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert and Richard Middleton (London: Routledge, 2003), pp. 204-14.
- 2007 'Performance Analysis and Chopin's Mazurka's, *Musicae Scientiae*, vol. 11, no. 2 (2007), pp. 153-4, 183-207.
- 2011 'Off the Record: Performance, History, and Musical Logic'. In *Music and the Mind: Essays in Honour of John Sloboda*, edited Irène Deliège and Jane Davidson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), pp. 291-310.
- 2013 *Beyond the Score: Music as Performance*

Debussy, Prelude Book 2, No. 7, '...La terrasse des audiences du clair de lune

8

pp

8^a b^a !

8^a b^a !

This system shows the beginning of the piece. The right hand features a complex, flowing melodic line with many sixteenth notes. The left hand provides a steady accompaniment with chords and single notes. The dynamic is marked *pp* (pianissimo). There are two '8^a b^a !' markings below the staves, indicating the starting point for an octave transposition.

pp

pp — *più pp*

p *marque*

8^a bassa

m.d.

m.d.

(8)

This system continues the piece. The right hand has dense chordal textures. The left hand has a more active line with some triplets. Dynamics include *pp*, *più pp*, and *p* *marque*. There are markings for *m.d.* (mezzo-dolce) and an '8^a bassa' marking. A circled '8' is also present.

(6) Un peu anime léger

pp

m.d.

pp

pp

8^a b^a !

This system features a more rhythmic and melodic texture. The right hand has a series of chords and moving lines. The left hand has a steady accompaniment. Dynamics include *pp* and *m.d.*. The instruction 'Un peu anime léger' is written above the first staff. There is a circled '6' and an '8^a b^a !' marking at the bottom.

Debussy, Prelude Book 2, No. 7, '...La terrasse des audiences du clair de lune

Plus lent

8

p

This system of musical notation consists of three staves. The top staff is in treble clef, the middle in alto clef, and the bottom in bass clef. The key signature has three sharps (F#, C#, G#). The tempo marking 'Plus lent' is positioned above the first staff. The first two measures show a melodic line in the upper staves and a rhythmic accompaniment in the lower staves. The third measure features a dynamic marking of *p* (piano) with a hairpin symbol. A dashed line with the number '8' above it indicates the start of the next system.

8

pp

(timbrez légèrement la petite note)

This system of musical notation continues from the first system. It also consists of three staves. The first two measures are marked with a dynamic of *pp* (pianissimo). The third measure contains a performance instruction: '(timbrez légèrement la petite note)'. The system concludes with a double bar line. A dashed line with the number '8' above it is positioned at the beginning of the system.

Charles Ives, *Concord Sonata*, First movement, 'Emerson'

Main 'Emerson' lyrical theme.

Musical notation for the main 'Emerson' lyrical theme. The notation is on a single treble clef staff. It begins with a *pp* dynamic marking. The melody consists of a series of eighth and quarter notes, followed by a half note, and then a quarter note. A crescendo hairpin leads to a *p* dynamic marking. The piece concludes with a *rit.* (ritardando) marking.

Musical notation for a section of the 'Emerson' movement. It features two staves: a treble clef staff and a bass clef staff. The treble staff begins with a *pp* dynamic marking and a triplet of eighth notes. The bass staff starts with a *poco rit.* marking. The treble staff has a *slowly* marking and a *faster* marking. The bass staff has a *pp* marking and a *f* marking. The notation includes various rhythmic values, including triplets and sixteenth notes.

Musical notation for a section of the 'Emerson' movement. It features two staves: a treble clef staff and a bass clef staff. The treble staff begins with a *f* dynamic marking and a first ending bracket. The bass staff has a *cresc. and faster* marking. The notation includes various rhythmic values, including triplets and sixteenth notes.

gradually faster with more and more action

Charles Ives, *Concord Sonata*, First movement, 'Emerson'

First system of the musical score. The right hand (r.h.) is marked *mf* and *quite fast*. The left hand (l.h.) is marked *p* and *rit.*. The score features complex polyrhythmic textures with multiple layers of notes in both hands.

Second system of the musical score. The right hand (r.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The left hand (l.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The score includes a section marked *slower and rather quietly again*. The texture remains dense and complex.

Third system of the musical score. The right hand (r.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The left hand (l.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The score includes a section marked *slower and rather quietly again*. The texture remains dense and complex.

Fourth system of the musical score. The right hand (r.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The left hand (l.h.) is marked *ff* and *very fast*. The score includes a section marked *slower and rather quietly again*. The texture remains dense and complex.

Michael Finnissy, *Kapitalistische Realisme*, as analysed by Richard Beaudoin

Distantly reflecting [$\text{♩} = 80$]

Collection: G Aeolian (plus $E\flat$) E major ($\flat 9 - \flat 9$)

*The G- $E\flat$ dyad

V⁷ of D →

Maestoso (sempre l'istesso tempo) subito

→ Cadence to D (outer-voice octaves)