Discourses of care, wellbeing and women's rights: a case study of Saving Mothers' Comadronas' understanding of reproductive health in Guatemala in the misinformation age

Journal:	*Health Care for Women International*
Manuscript ID	Draft
Manuscript Type:	Original Papers
Keywords:	Communication, community engagement, misinformation, Reproductive Health, feminist methods

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16

Discourses of care, wellbeing and women's rights: a case study of *Saving Mothers' Comadronas'* understanding of reproductive health in Guatemala in the misinformation age

For Peer Review Only

17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

ABSTRACT

The pushback on women's health rights, particularly when it comes to more vulnerable groups like indigenous women, has necessitated new approaches for targeted communication strategies by health NGOs on sexuality and reproductive health rights (SRHR). To assess indigenous women's understanding of health communications on SRHR, this study conducted focus groups with the *comadronas* of *Saving Mothers* in Guatemala to explore their reception to these messages. Results of the study underscored the difficulties of access of these groups to quality information on reproductive health matters, placing limits on their capacity to navigate a complex (and manipulated) media landscape on SRHR. The findings of this research thus underscored the necessity to foster partnerships between NGOs, indigenous women's groups, researchers and government to enhance health literacy skills, engaging with communities so as to co-create communications material that attends specifically to their needs.

For Peer Review Only

KEYWORDS:

community engagement, feminist methods, reproductive health, social media, health literacy, and misinformation

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

INTRODUCTORY PARAGRAPH

This study contributes theoretically and empirically to studies on women's health in the field of global health, particularly to a recent body of work on the ways misinformation on reproductive health online (as well as within the media more broadly) is having an impact on women's understandings of their health rights, including their capacity to consume accurate information on SRHR. Focusing on the case of Guatemala but situating this within a wider body of research conducted by the PI on other local communities in Brazil and in the US (2023; 2024ab), among others, this research sheds light on the barriers that exist for disadvantaged women's groups to access adequate information on reproductive health, exposing the difficulties of information flows and underlining the existence of poor communications on the topic. The work thus contributes to studies on community health and health disparities within local contexts, providing more feminist perspectives on gender in global health (author, 2023) as well as further contributing to debates on the 'de-colonising of global health' by increasing the shift to local contexts so as to better understand health inequities and their interconnection to political and economic constraints. It further emphasises how communications can potentially enable 'empowerment' as well as reproduce inequalities. The research here is highly interdisciplinary, drawing from the fields of communications, health communications, sociology, development and gender studies, and public health.

For Peer Review Only

BACKGROUND

Sexual and reproductive health rights have come under attack particularly in the last years across the world, amid the rise of far right populist groups from Europe to Latin America and the US, amid the counter-framing of discourses against the 'women's rights' agenda during the 1980s and 1990s (Friedman, 2003). In the post-pandemic context, and among a growing disillusionment

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

with Western institutions, there has been a proliferation of misinformation and manipulation of reproductive health matters online (Malki et al, 2023; Selvi et al, 2024; John et al, 2024). Operating under various socio-economic and geopolitical constraints that have impacted their communications and messaging on reproductive health rights (author, 2023), various women's health NGOs worldwide have faced many challenges in their advocacy on SRHR, from India to Brazil and the US, many NGOs have been targets of conservative attacks on reproductive health orchestrated by political 'populist' groups as part of their crusade against a supposedly 'imposed gender ideology' on governments and communities by feminists, challenging their efficacy in their communities (author, 2023) .

Furthermore, a lack of access to health literacy resources, limits the capacity of women, girls and other community members to navigate through the political manipulation and media misinformation, which does not necessarily solely circulate online, and is an - element of a wider manipulated rhetoric on SRHR in the mediated (global) public sphere (author,2023). Consequently, this discursive strategy and manipulative rhetoric can lead to 'alarmist' understandings of SRHR, such as that it promotes 'forced abortions', and is perpetuated by 'feminists' who want to undermine 'traditional family values' (author, 2023), undermining an informed and holistic understanding of SRHR.

As author (2023) has evidenced, the consumption of 'hard facts' on sexuality and reproductive health is not enough. Rather, people need to feel more connected to the messages at an emotional level, relating these to their lived experiences. These findings resonate with other results from the literature on science communications (Nutbeam et al, 2018; Scrimshaw, 2019), which revealed how people process 'scientific facts' through a series of filters, including generational differences, culture, language, and socio-economic status. Furthermore, a growing body of literature underscores the rise of misinformation on reproductive health online and on social media within different local and global contexts (e.g. Malki et al, 2023; John et al, 2024), threatening to harm health outcomes and making it more challenging for women to navigate a polarised information landscape. This is

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

particularly more pronounced for Latin American women's indigenous communities, who are also inserted within deeply rooted authoritarian, patriarchal and highly unequal societies.

Guatemala is thus an important country to examine misinformation and reproductive health,. as it has some of the poorest reproductive health indices and largest disparities in health in Latin America, particularly among indigenous women (Speizer et al, 2003). Research study conducted in 2015 by the *Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales-Guatemala* (FLACSO-Guatemala) and the U.S.-based Guttmacher Institute, looked at sexuality education programs for adolescents at 80 secondary schools in three geographically and culturally diverse areas: Guatemala City, Huehuetenango and Chiquimula. Overall, researchers found that only 7% of surveyed students aged 14–17 said they had been taught all the topics that constitute Comprehensive Sexuality Education (CSE), with the least taught topics being those related to contraceptive methods and HIV/STIs (Monzón et al., 2017)[1].

Various NGOs have talked about setbacks when it comes to upholding rights. According to the organization *IncideJoven -We Lead* ('Nosotras Lideramos'), the last years have seen significant setbacks , with the approval of the decree 18-2022 "Law for the Protection of Life and Family" in March 8 2022 that increased penalties for abortion and prohibited CSE education that called into question traditional values.[2]In the 'Demystifying Data Fact Sheet' published in 2014, the *Guttmacher Institute* and the *International Planned Parenthood* (IPPF) underlined in the report both married and unmarried women's unmet need for contraception, underscoring the necessity for sexual and reproductive health information and services (Guttmacher Institute and IPPF, 2014, 2), and this is particularly vital for indigenous communities.[3] The 2014 fact sheet emphasized how 'action was

[1] Monzón, A. S., Ramazzini, A. L., Prada, E., Stillman, M., & Leong, E. (2017). From Paper to Practice: Sexuality Education Policies and Curricula and Their Implementation in Guatemala. *Guttmacher Institute*. https://live.guttmacher.org/report/paper-practice-sexuality-education-policies-and-curricula-and-their-implementation-guatemala

[2] See UPR Info's information sheet: https://upr-info.org/sites/default/files/country-document/2022-12/TANUXIL_Factsheet_EN_Guatemala.pdf

[3] Guttmacher and IPPF fact sheet (2014): https://www.guttmacher.org/sites/default/files/factsheet/fb-dd-guatemala.pdf

whitlocke@uncw.edu

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

needed' to address various factors, from 'the lack of affordable health services to stigma surrounding sexual activity among unmarried women and lack of agency among young women, especially in the under resourced indigenous communities… .'

Prior HIV prevention research among indigenous Guatemalans revealed low levels of HIV knowledge as well as high levels of perceived HIV severity, high risk sexual behaviors and stigma against people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA). The high degree of severity associated with HIV/AIDS was due to incomplete information about the disease and its treatment, coupled with privacy concerns about HIV testing that may reduce testing uptake in addition to a decrease in access to treatment (author,2017; author, 2019; author 2019). Similarly, the *comadronas* showed low levels of familiarity with HIV, expressing a desire to learn about HIV risk and prevention. (author, 2020). This lack of HIV prevention information necessitates a call for new community based and culturally tailored interventions, which could utilize local stake holders, NGO's and relevant media platforms (author,2017; author, 2019; author, 2019). Subsequently, a recent community-based intervention has shown preliminary acceptability and feasibility (Nogueira, Salazar, Hernandez. Orr et., al. 2023).

In the case of SRHR, the consumption of information on reproductive health rights has been impacted by a complex web of cultural and social norms, values and beliefs that shape the communication discourse and understandings that people have of these health communication messages (author, 2023). This challenging wider geopolitical and economic context ends up putting pressure on the advocacy communications of NGOs working in the field, who can find themselves 'on the defensive' and doing 'fact checking' on public health arguments (author, 2023), whilst at the same time the proliferation of misinformation and stigmatization of issues concerning women's sexuality and reproductive health, particularly online, contribute to distort messages and infuse them with ideologies, having consequences on women's abilities to consume accurate health information and exercise their reproductive health rights (author, 2023).

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Like other countries in Latin America and the Caribbean, abortion in Guatemala is largely restricted and is only permitted when the life of the woman is in danger. Unsafe abortion practices contribute to Guatemala's high maternal mortality ratio, the highest in Central America (Guttmacher Institute, 2014). *Saving Mothers*, based in New York and with offices in Kenya, Guatemala, and the Dominican Republic has been at the forefront of women's health rights. *Saving Mothers* is a global NGO of allied healthcare professionals dedicated to preventing maternal deaths and birth related complications among marginalised women,[4]with NGOs workings with local governments in the western highlands department of Solola since 2009, providing education and training to local healthcare providers and *comadronas* on maternal and reproductive health.

Guatemala's indigenous culture is deeply rooted in longstanding traditional practices that believe traditional healers and *comadronas* possess Mayan ancestral medical lore, and their legitimacy is rooted in the trust placed in them by their indigenous communities (Chaudhry et al, 2018). In 2014 the NGO established the School of PowHER (*Providing Outreach in Women's Health and Educational Resources*, SOP), a transformative model of *comadrona* recruitment and training that equips *comadronas* with skills in basic prenatal care and safe labor practices, fostering values of knowledge sharing, apprenticeship and collaboration with local health facility providers (Chaudhry et al, 2018). We thus partnered with *Saving Mothers* to conduct two focus groups with the *comadronas* in order to assess their reception of reproductive health communication messages, with the goal of better understanding the challenges and the barriers that the groups face, so as to highlight routes to enhanced communications and education on reproductive health and rights.

METHOD

PARTICIPANTS

[4] The organization states that up to 73% of global maternal deaths are from preventable obstetric cases, leading 830 women to die everyday from preventable cases related to pregnancy and childbirth.

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60

Feminist researchers within the Social Science have long highlighted the effectiveness of the focus groups method as a means of giving voice to marginalized and other stigmatized identities, thus raising their awareness and being thus a vital tool to reach at *socially produced knowledge* of the social world (Haraway, 1991; Wilkinson, 1998). This research has adopted a feminist epistemological concern, making use of a participatory methodological approach which focused on creating egalitarian and 'safe spaces' where the *Comadronas* could share their personal stories about how they deal with the challenges on understanding messages on reproductive health, providing them with an opportunity also for discussing with other women possible options for improvements in communication content.

For Peer Review Only

Two focus groups with *Comadronas* from *Saving Mothers* were conducted online via Zoom on September the 7th and 8th 2023, connecting the researchers in the UK and Miami to Guatemala. The groups had a total of 10 (*n*=10) participants in the first group (FG1) and 8 (*n*=8) in the second (FG2). The first group consisted of *Saving Mothers Comadronas* (27-59 years of age), with an average of 10 years experience, whereas the second group was composed of *abuela comadronas* (59 – 82), with 20 to 50 years work experience and no formal training. The former session was conducted entirely in Spanish and translated to English, whereas the latter was conducted in their original native tongue *Tz'utujil*, one of the 26 Mayan languages, having also been translated into both Spanish and English[5].

PROCEDURE

The research obtained IRB approval from the US's institution where the PI was based in 2023. Participants were recruited through *Saving Mothers* in Guatemala. Researchers were aware of the sensitivities around SRHR matters, including how participants might feel, and how certain social,

[5] The translation of the sessions was done by *Saving Mothers* as well as by the PhD student at the US institution where the PI was based in 2023.

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

cultural and religious beliefs could constrain certain responses. Therefore, the PI build rapport with the participants, making them feel at ease whilst also providing an introduction to the research project at the start of the sessions.

A total of 500 dollars disbursed for the participant payment in the form of small gifts. The first group received water bottles, nail files and polish, and hand lotion whereas the second group of the *abuelas* received a box of latex gloves and a birthing kit. Participants were asked at the start of the sessions to grant their verbal informed consent. Participants were anonymized and identified according to the letters of the alphabet (A, B, C) for each group, all composed by indigenous Mayan women. The first group included five who identified themselves as 'educators', two 'principal educators', one 'administrative assistant/nursing student', one 'director of school' and another a 'programme coordinator', with a yearly income which varied between U$ 1.,384.61-2,153.85. The second group all identified as 'midwife', however the income was not disclosed. Both sessions lasted two hours.

INSTRUMENTATION

The researchers developed the interview guide for the focus groups sessions. The focus groups were guided by three research questions*: 1) How do disadvantaged women's communities respond to messages on SRHR?* 2) *How does misinformation about women's reproductive health affect their perceptions, and their ability to access accurate information? and* 3) *How can messages and campaigns on the topic be improved, catering better to the needs of local women's groups?*

RESULTS

ANALYSIS

The data collected was then analysed using thematic analysis, with the intention of classifying the responses and identifying patterns. A coding scheme was developed which focused on seven key

whitlocke@uncw.edu

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

phrases on SRHR (1); media consumption (2); SRHR online information (3); talk on SRHR in the public/private sphere (4); local media coverage (5); personal narratives on SRHR (6) and improvements in communications on SRHR (7). The researchers used open and axial coding to gain insights from the focus groups.

A comparative analytical method was employed (Kendall, 1999) to identify categories, reflecting the participants' responses to the questions. The use of axial coding permits one to put data back together in new ways after open coding, making connections between categories (Kish-Doto et al. 2014). This allowed the researchers to first break up the data and to categorize it (open coding), before linking codes to contexts and causes (axial coding) (Strauss and Corbin, 1998).

The data was then organized so that similarities and differences between the responses of both groups could be identified, including an association between constraints in the public sphere on SRHR talk (e.g. within institutions) with how discourses unfolded in the mediated public sphere and in private settings. These concerns cut across both groups and was irrespective of age. Both groups identified gradual changes within Guatemalan society in terms of discussing more SRHR matters, however it was seen as still being a bit of a 'taboo', and still subject to constraints.

For Peer Review Only

COMMUNIT RESPONSES TO SRHR MESSAGES

The results of the first part of the focus group sessions (FG1 and FG2) revealed how the comadronas were aware of the problems around sexual and reproductive health rights in Guatemala, underscoring also the cultural and religious constraints that they thought impacted talk (and communications) on reproductive health matters in the private and public spheres. Many of them provided personal narratives and lived experiences of dealing with the challenges of accessing information on SRHR, including being able to transmit this to other women. They further lamented the little support from local governments and authorities.

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

The first group (FG1) connected women's rights and bodily autonomy with reproductive health rights, highlighting also the problem of lack of adequate and more quality information on the issue. Participant 2 specifically emphasized the 'right to your own body' and the choice that women should have in family planning, whereas participant 1 stressed the lack of information:

…….Women's reproductive rights do exist here in Guatemala. One has the right to decide how many children they have, when they want to have them, and whether they want to use contraception. You have the right to your own body... (Participant 2, FG1)

……The problem I've observed here in the village is a lack of accurate information regarding women's sexual and reproductive health, family planning, and the examinations that women should undergo, such as Pap smears and transvaginal ultrasounds. They are not familiar with these exams and have inadequate information." (Participant 1, FG1)

The Abuela group of *Comadronas* also identified similar concerns. Participant 3 (FG2) stated how she seeks to 'educate' other patients, further outlining the role of education in opening up more debate on the topic:

A lot of people are becoming aware of women's health. I personally educate my patients….although today's generation…..already have a lot of information…. today's generation is much more open to these themes compared to our generation because educational spaces, such as schools, have influenced this topic. However, there is still a big part of our population that does not accept or rejects this theme... (Participant 3, FG2)

Participants 2 (FG2) further mentioned how they received their training through the *Centro de Salud,* with doctors making them aware of their reproductive health rights. Participant 2 however

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60

affirmed that the government had been 'careless' in the health sector, leaving women with no choice but to use 'natural' herbs in their family planning and pregnancy prevention methods:

Sexual/reproductive rights is when a woman becomes aware and decides about her reproduction…. After working as a midwife for 6 years, the first clinic in my town opened, and one of the doctors there made me aware of my sexual health and oriented me to use a contraceptive …..my husband was bothered with me for working as a midwife and asked that I become pregnant ….He insisted…but I decided that 'no'…. I had 9 pregnancies, 7 children that are alive, and 2 abortions. Now I advise my patients that they do the same, that they can prioritize themselves as women ….there are many family planning methods….In terms of pregnancy prevention, I didn't know any clinical method for women, it was using natural herbs that women could space out their pregnancies.. (Participant 5, FG2)

The government has been careless in the health arena…. At the Centros de Salud (governmental public health clinics), we cannot count on resources and medications for everyone….The solution that we midwives have found is to utilize natural medications for spacing out pregnancies." (Participant 2, FG2)

For Peer Review Only

Participants 8 and 9 (FG1) also made connections between the lack of information on SRHR matters with education, starting from early childhood in the family. Participant 8 highlighted how women in Guatemala frequently are not provided with adequate information on the need to take folic acid to prepare themselves for pregnancy. The participants also noted that SRHR is also still seen as being a bit of a 'taboo' due to cultural and religious constraints. Participant 9 (FG1) further affirmed that 'conservative groups' also block communication channels, preventing information from reaching the wider population':

…I can speak from my context. There is very little information about reproductive health.... Here in our town, we have media outlets like radio, television, and the internet, but there is still a

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

significant gap because those who control these media outlets are older individuals who do not provide access to reproductive health information to the population….there are many conservative groups that block these channels to prevent information from reaching the entire population, especially in rural areas. So they do not have information about their health, let alone their reproductive health… (Participant 9, FG1)

… I believe this issue has deep roots…. Most parents do not possess the ability…to educate their sons and daughters…today we see a scarcity of information, but we are already conditioned to consider it a 'taboo'. Many people in our community do not accept discussing this topic… There's a less-than-adequate system in Guatemala that provides vitamin supplementation like ferrous sulphate and folic acid. Women are supposed to take these supplements for three or six months after treatment to prepare their bodies for pregnancy. However, we see that people in the community lack this education. When they receive these vitamins, they often do not take them and leave them unused…." (Participant 8, FG1)

The *comadronas* underlined some of the problems they experienced when it comes to reproductive health, outlining the constraints imposed by religious and cultural norms, as well as the lack of investment and support received from governments. The next section explores the barriers they encounter in accessing accurate information on SRHR.

ACCESS TO INFORMATION (AND MISINFORMATION) AS BARRIERS TO 'EMPOWERMENT'

The *comadronas* revealed in the focus group sessions that their main medium of information is the radio, and that they do not have access to more in depth information on SRHR. Some participants pointed out that the information that does circulate in the media tends to be more concentrated on basic facts, such as on women's anatomy (body parts). Both groups stated that they do not access

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

information on reproductive health from the internet and are not familiar with technologies such as *WhatsApp.*

.....in the past, there were no means like television, radios, or the internet, and we did not have access to those topics. But nowadays, it's somewhat available, although not in-depth topics related to sexuality, only basic information about body parts…. it's about anatomy. Some people do access those topics, while others do not….there are people for whom the body is sacred... (Participant 6, FG1)

For Peer Review Only

Participants 1, 2 and 8 (FG2) stated that radio is a source of information for women's health, however communications here on SRHR could improve, respecting more the needs of the communities:

When I was young, I heard no information about women's health in general, it was a taboo... Now I have heard campaigns about women's health on the radio. There is more talk about pregnancy prevention, and now we can see that many more women are already using some form of contraception. But you can also see that some people disagree, it is each individual's decision… (Participant 1, FG2)

There is a lot of information disseminated through the popular radio of our town, but we also ask that it respects our culture because the information that is delivered in some way the people don't utilize it correctly anymore. Therefore, we want our natural medicine to be strengthened… because each body is different…. For many youngsters, the more information they have, the more mistakes they make…The internet is good, and I imagine that there is true information, but also through this means of communication, it is possible to violate the integrity of women's rights….. (Participant 8, FG2)

In the radio and Centros de Salud, they do a lot of campaigns but unfortunately it is only information propagated, they have no commitment to following through. On many occasions, they

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

violate women's rights because they don't attend to them. We educate the women and when they go to the Centros de Salud, they don't follow them or orient them about their health.. (Participant 2, FG2)

Despite the topic still being seen as constrained within the private and public sphere settings, the *Comadronas* pointed to some change in the last years, with more talk about pregnancy prevention, despite the resistance still in pursuing more in-depth discussions. The media were also seen as part of the problem, for not providing more in depth coverage. Information was mainly through the church, health centres and specialised medical NGOs like *Saving Mothers*. The *comadronas* underscored the multiple barriers that they encounter in assisting women with their reproductive rights.

Participants 5 and 1 (FG1) talked about some incidents of confusion around conversations on SRHR, which often have been constrained by social and cultural factors which influence understandings on reproductive health matters. Communities are thus left highly dependent on the knowledge that the mid-wives bring to obtain accurate information:

…..There are organizations here in Santiago that talk about family planning…, and health personnel do so as well, provided the husband is present. Sometimes, the mother-in-law is present, and they interpret things differently. That's why mothers-in-law or husbands do not accept family planning topics…..According to what my colleague Juana tells me….she says that she has experience with patients who not only lack information but also encounter contradicting beliefs. Some women believe that when a person uses family planning methods, it can cause ovarian cysts…. Additionally, women believe that family planning methods can cause uterine tumors,….Juana tells me….her patients have mentioned that when a woman uses family planning, it may cause a cyst or

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

a tumor in the uterus. That's why women are afraid to use a family planning method. …. (Participant 5, FG1)

…..We obtain the information to go with patients to explain or provide information about the topic from various sources. We attend training sessions at the health centre, where we can also gather information about reproductive health…..they also provide us with brochures that explain methods, and that's what we use as a guide when we provide information about family planning... . (Participant 1, FG1)

After outlining the barriers that the *comadronas* have in obtaining accurate information on SRHR, and their sense of disempowerment, the next section moves on to discuss their understandings of communication campaigns, with their suggestions for improvement.

CONSTRAINTS ON TALK ON SRHR MATTERS

The focus group sessions (FG1 and FG2) also explored the c*omadronas'* consumption of health campaigns on SRHR. Discussions on SRHR matters were seen as very much restricted, impacting women's access to reproductive health services as well as disempowering them of their rights due to a lack of a more nuanced understanding of the topic. Participants 6, 8 and 9 (FG1) discussed how there are still constraints within institutions, outlining the combined impact of conservative beliefs and of religion, such as Catholicism and Evangelicalism, on talk on SRHR, with the persistence of access to adequate information as well as the limited access to healthcare. This all contributes to limits in the in depth knowledge that these communities have about their own sexual health, impeding them from fully achieving their rights.

Participant 9 stated how abortion is still an illegal practice in the country, although widely practiced:

whitlocke@uncw.edu

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

… I believe in many other countries, religion and politics are closely intertwined….in our population, abortion is practiced illegally, either by the woman's own decision or by family…. There have been initiatives to promote change, but it has not been possible to enact legislation ….due to religious and political reasons….we also see a high rate of teenage pregnancies, which occur for many reasons, including cases of abuse, and there is no legislation that can protect….women… speaking about the change in presidency, Guatemala is still not ready for these changes because the conservative sectors here are very strong…I believe that for the time being, legislating for such changes is not possible. We have heard about laws…in Argentina, where the abortion law was approved, but the information we receive suggests that this is wrong…(Participant 9, FG1)

Participants 7 and 2 (FG1) also talked about the 'cultural values' that exist within Guatemalan society, shared by indigenous and Maya people, including the 'right to live'. Participant 2 showed distrust of governmental bodies and institutions, not seeing much change in the short-term, despite the start of a new presidency:[6]

I think that due to the budget constraints of the Ministry of Health here in Guatemala, they don't prioritize our health. This is maintained by the authorities and the limited information available when one visits the clinics. I believe that the healthcare sector is very weak here, and there's no way to produce any promotional materials or campaigns. This requires funding: for example, if they want to create a TV spot, it requires financial resources, monthly, quarterly, or annual payments.. (Participant 2, FG1)

..In the debates that have taken place, within the culture that we, as Maya people, practice, the legalization of abortion will not be approved. This is due to our cultural beliefs, and it would be

[6] Bernardo Arevalo was sworn in as president in January 14, 2024, seen by many as representing change and a 'new spring' for the country. For more, see 'A new spring: Giuatemala's Arevedo becomes president after Congress delays' (https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/1/15/guatemalas-arevalo-becomes-president-on-anticorruption-plank-amid-chaos< , 15 Jan 2024)

whitlocke@uncw.edu

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

something very divisive for Guatemala. At no point would all four ethnic groups that make up Guatemala agree to such a law.….. (Participant 7, FG1)

SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENTS ON SRHR COMMUNICATIONS

Finally, the *Comadronas* from both groups were also asked about their opinions concerning media coverage, as well as how they would go about improving messages. Participant 9, 6, 1 and 2 (FG1) highlighted the construction of campaigns more tailored to the communities and their needs, including some in the *Tz'utujil* language, as well as the creation of more 'dialogue' and 'dramatized messages' that can reach out more to communities.

...we would have to introduce information gradually, not all at once, because we might also create conflict within the community...perhaps it will work, but the information would need to be presented gradually, so that it is accepted by the community…. it would be in our language, in the Tz'utujil language, and we would also have to create it as a dialogue. People like to see small dramatizations, so right now, I'm thinking about how to create small dialogues, dramatize them... (Participant 9, FG1)

…I believe it would also depend on each population: there are communities with varying levels of education, and some may struggle to understand certain information. We might either be helping or harming them….it's necessary to categorize the population and determine if they require visuals, explanations, or just descriptions. (Participant 6, FG1)

Other participants emphasized how there should be better use of social media platforms. Participant 1 talked also about creating videos on *TikTok*, whereas participant 2 talked about creating 'dramatized storytelling content':

For Peer Review Only
whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

…What we were discussing with our colleagues is that perhaps on internet platforms, we could create some videos or manage it on TikTok…. when it comes to radio stations or local television media within the community, it's a bit impossible due to the policies in place and our culture. I believe that in those cases, we would have to be very cautious when creating videos and dialogues. We would have to carefully choose our words and convey them precisely to avoid misinterpretation and also prevent the community from turning against us. (Participant 1, FG1)

….we could create like a poster, or, you know, a piece of paper that tells a story. So the story ….develops and has pictures, like cartoons… a story….that starts from the very beginning, and then it develops as the story goes... (Participant 2, FG1)

Participant 8 (FG2) discussed also the implementation of more partnerships between the state and municipal governments in the health field, including engaging more with 'educating' women about their reproductive health, such as in cases of use of contraceptive methods. Participant 5 talked about the importance of having access to 'correct' information, and not 'misinformation' and manipulation:

The distribution of drugs is increasingly being done without major problems, so it is time to educate children and give them adequate information. Work in the community must first begin to raise awareness among patients about the dangers that exist in having unsuitable information and the effects of drug addiction, mainly for women… (Participant 5, FG2)

The process is slow, since there is a lot of information in different media, and it is difficult to demonstrate the truthfulness of that information. So the coordination of the municipal and state government is necessary. Just as I mentioned the re-education of a population is so slow so it must be done together. (Participant 8, FG2)

Thus, it is important to create more culturally sensitive content, tailored to the communities who will also actively participate in these interventions.

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

DISCUSSION

The findings of this study have highlighted how the *comadronas* do not feel that they receive adequate and in-depth information on reproductive health matters, and that they generally feel disempowered from debates in the public sphere on SRHR as well as disconnected from local governmental institutions. These results answer our first and second research questions, on how communities understand SRHR matters and how misinformation (here understood as 'poor information' or 'the lack of information') has an impact on women's understanding of reproductive health, making it challenging for them to navigate the media landscape, thus excluding them from participation in the SRHR mediated public sphere of debate.

As Malki et al (2023, 420) have noted, misinformation is seen as a threat to public health and to the erosion of democratic institutions, with misinformation regarding women's health attracting more interest in the wake of Covid-19 and the overturning of *Roe x Wade* in the US when previously the gender focus had been overlooked. Within the US context, misinformation is largely associated with ideological pro-choice arguments and anti-feminist rhetoric, whereas in Guatemala it is about the lack of information as well as restrictions on information flows and in-depth discussions, leading to the stigmatization of the topic and ultimately resulting in a form of 'manipulation'.

The *comadronas* further expressed interest in being co-participants in the construction of health communication messages that could better attend to the interests of their communities, answering our third research question, on how media messages and campaigns can be improved. The *comadronas* stated how they do not obtain information on reproductive health online, and that they are not users of technologies like *Whatsapp.* They underlined the superficiality of the information on sexuality and reproductive health that does circulate in the media, largely focused on information about women's basic body parts.

The participants did not however make direct links between the political situation in Guatemala with the quality of information circulating on SRHR. Reproductive health was classified as being

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

still a bit of a 'taboo', despite a growth in debates in the media. The *comadronas* thus identified an overall media coverage which is still largely constrained by religious, social and cultural norms that penetrate discourses and talk on SRHR in the mediated public sphere. The findings of both the focus group sessions thus showed similar concerns shared among both age groups, with the *comadronas* underlining the little access they have to the media in Guatemala and underscoring the largely 'poor' or almost 'non-existent' media coverage on the topic.

Given however that the *comadronas* work 'on the ground' providing health services to women, both women's groups showed quite a bit of depth knowledge of reproductive health matters, managing to establish important connections between SRHR to the upholding of women's rights. Moreover, similarly to other Latin American countries in the 1970s and 1980s, Guatemala has also had experience with military dictatorships, but in contrast to other Latin American nations, it has seen a slower path towards democratization. Thus in Guatemala the role of the church and religion play also a central part in 'controlling' and managing debate on SRHR matters, a situation also found in other Latin American countries (author, 2023; 2024ab). The *comadronas* thus did not see the new political regime as necessarily paving the way for improvements in women's health rights, as they pointed to the persistence still of cultural, social and religious barriers and structural inequities, including access to quality health services and accurate information.

LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

Previous research of the PI (author, 2023) engaged with communities in Latin America (Brazil) as well as with over 50 women's health NGOs located in the US, Europe, UK and India. This study has extended the focus to include Central America (Guatemala). More work however needs still needs to be done to better comprehend the complex interplay of upholding reproductive health rights 'on the ground' amid the persistence of socio-cultural and religious barriers as well as political and economic challenges, which contribute to impact health communication messages on reproductive

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

health, and how these are understood in the mediated public sphere and consumed by targeted groups. This study is thus still pursuing further research with more women's groups within local contexts, including in South Asia and other parts of the world, aiming to conduct further press and social media analysis of networks to examine media misinformation, assessing how media messages that circulate in the public sphere are received by targeted communities within local contexts.

CONCLUSION

Both focus groups conducted with the *comadronas* underscored the necessity of improvements in communications on SRHR, from a more nuanced media coverage to better media campaigns on reproductive health. Although they do not access online media due to access issues, they nonetheless showed knowledge of the topic and expressed interest in participating more in the *co-construction* of health communication messages to attend better to the needs of their communities.

Studies like these can assist interventions aimed at improving narratives and discourses around reproductive health and by introducing media and health literacy to these communities through toolkits and capacity training. Thus it is important to establish partnerships between local NGOs, the indigenous rural women's communities with the researchers, government bodies and health professionals for the improvement in the media and health literacy skills of the communities, leading to the co-creation of communications messages and campaigns on reproduction health, was also recognised as a key aim for the advancement and progress of the reproductive health rights of the affected communities.

For Peer Review Only

REFERENCES

Correa, S. and Petchesky, R. 1994. "Reproductive and sexual rights: a feminist perspective." In Sen, G., Germain, A., Lincoln, C. Chen (Eds.) *Population policies reconsidered: health, empowerment and rights,* Boston: Harvard University Press

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Chaudhry S., Oliveira J., Shirazian T. 2018. 'The emerging role of the *comadrona* as a broker between ancient cultural beliefs and modern biomedicalization to improve maternal health care in Guatemala". In Schwartz, D (Eds.) *Maternal Death and Pregnancy-Related Morbidity Among Indigenous Women of Mexico and Central America*, Springer, Cham. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-71538-4_31

Author . 2017.

Author. 2019.

Author. 2020.

Author .2019.

Friedman, E. J. 2003. "Gendering the agenda: the impact of transnational women's rights movement at the UN conferences of the 1990s". In *Women's Studies International Forum*, vol. 26, no. 4, 313-331

Guttmacher Institute. (2017, May 25) "Sexuality education in Guatemala must be fully implemented to meet adolescents' needs." In Guttmacher Institute. Available at: https://www.guttmacher.org/news-release/2017/sexuality-education-guatemala-must-be-fully-implemented-meet-adolescents-needs

Guttmacher Institute and International Planned Parenthood Federation. 2014. "Demystifying data – fact sheet – Sexual and Reproductive Health of Young Women in Guatemala" report. Available at: https://www.guttmacher.org/sites/default/files/factsheet/fb-dd-guatemala.pdf

Harcourt, W. 2009. "Reproductive bodies." In *Body Politics in development: critical alternatives in gender and development* (38-65). London: Zed Books

Haraway, D. 1991. "Situated knowledges: the science question in feminism and the privilege of partial perspective". In *Simians, Cyborgs and Women: the reinvention of nature* (183-201), London: Free Association

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60

John, J. W., Gorman, S., Scales, D. and Gorman, J. (2024, November). "Online misleading information about women's reproductive health: a narrative review." In *J. Gen. Intern Med.* Available at: https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/39511120/

Kendal, J. 1999. "Axial coding and the grounded theory controversy." In *Western Journal of Nursing Research* 21 (6), 743-757

Kish-Doto, J. Scales, M., Eguino-Medina, P., Ritzgerald, T., Tzang, J. P., McCormack, L. A., O'Donoghue, A., Oluwamurewa, O. and West, S. L. 2014. "Preferences for patient medication information: what do patient's want?" In *Journal of Health Communication* 19, 77-88

Malki, L. M., Patel, D. and Singh, A. 2023. "A mixed methods analysis of women's health misinformation on social media." In *Human Computer Interaction 2023* (conference paper), Springer Nature Link

Author. 2024a.

Author.2024b.

Author.2023.

Nogueira, N. F., Salazar, A. S., Hernandez. L, Orr, J., Beato, P., Alcaide, M. L., Montano, N. P., Cianelli, R., Villegas, N., Jones, D. J. and Dunleavy, V. O. 2023. "Acceptability, suitability and feasibility of an evidence-based intervention to reduce HIV risk behaviours: engaging *comadronas* in HIV prevention in rural Guatemala." In *Aids Education and Prevention* 35 (2), 101-113

Nutbeam, D., McGill, B. and Premkumar, P. 2018 "Improving health literacy in community populations: a review of progress." In *Health Promotion International* 33 (5), 901-911

Scrimshaw, S. 2019. "Science, health and cultural literacy in a rapidly changing communications landscape." In *PNAS,* vol. 116, n. 16, 7650-7655

Selvi, A. A. and Arulchelvan, S. 2024 "Decoding global reproductive health discourse on Reddit." In *African Journal of Reproductive Health*, published by Women's Health and Action Research Centre (WHARC)

whitlocke@uncw.edu

For Peer Review Only

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

Speizer, I. S., Magnani, R. J. and Colvin, C. E. 2003. “The effectiveness of adolescent reproductive health interventions in developing countries: A review of the evidence.” In *Journal of Adolescent Health*, 33(5), 324-348 (https://www.guttmacher.org/sites/default/files/article_files/3809912.pdf)

Strauss, A. L. and Corbin, J. 1998. *Basics of qualitative research: grounded theory procedures and research*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage

Wilkinson, S. 1998. “Focus groups in feminist research: power, interaction and co-construction of meaning.” In *Women’s Studies International Forum* 21, no. 1, 111-125

For Peer Review Only

whitlocke@uncw.edu